

Xavier Calvez Chief Financial Officer ICANN

7 February 2022

Dear Xavier,

Statement of the Generic Names Supporting Organization Council on ICANN's Draft FY23-27 Operating & Financial Plan + Draft FY23 Operating Plan & Budget

The Generic Names Supporting Organization (GNSO) Council welcomes the opportunity to provide input on those aspects of the draft FY23-27 Operating & Financial Plan ("FY23 OFP") including the draft FY23 Operating Plan & Budget ("FY23 Budget") that are of relevance to the GNSO Council's remit, which are managers of the policy development process for generic top level domains. Thus, while this statement is made on behalf of the GNSO Council, our comments are intended to complement, and not replace, any input that may be provided by individual GNSO Stakeholder Groups and Constituencies.

This comment was prepared by the Council's Standing Committee on Budget and Operations (SCBO), whose membership includes both Councilors and Subject Matter Experts from across the GNSO. The SCBO focused its efforts on exploring whether or not the resources directed at policy development are appropriate, both in relation to current workload, and in view of planned policy activities for FY23 and the risks or threats to the fulfillment of the GNSO Council's responsibilities within ICANN's larger mission and remit.

General Comments:

- As we have mentioned in previous comments, as part of its review, the GNSO Council examines the proposed budget to understand what resources have been allocated to each GNSO Stakeholder Group, and to the other Supporting Organizations and Advisory Committees. In prior years (FY19 as an example), that information was available to the community in the proposed budgets. However, this information is missing in the FY23 Budget. The GNSO Council requests that this level of information be provided. Although we have budget experts drawn from the various GNSO constituencies as part of the SCBO, we find it is difficult (as noted in prior comment submissions) without greater detail to approximate the levels of financial support provided directly and indirectly to the various Supporting Organizations, Advisory Groups, and associated Stakeholder Groups and Constituencies. This information is essential for each of these groups, including the GNSO Council to hold ourselves, and others, mutually accountable.
- It has also been mentioned in past comments that the GNSO Council seeks to ensure that the annual Operation and Financial Plans and annual Budgets provide Working Group Chairs with tools and support to ensure effective and efficient leadership. We were pleased to be informed that the enterprise-wide project management software has been purchased, and to see the planned addition of two full-time employees since the adopted FY22 FTE levels. In addition, the GNSO Council is informed that certain specific expenses for important policy-making tools, such as software and consultants, are covered in areas of the budget that appear well-funded.

Specific Comments Related to the draft FY23-27 Operating & Financial Plan:

In the GNSO Council's comments on the Five Year Strategic and Operating Plan ("5YS&OP") it identified the following specific issues that are applicable to the FY23 OFP:

- Evolve and Strengthen the Multistakeholder Model to Facilitate Diverse and Inclusive Participation in Policymaking
 - OFP Issue 1. Maintain adequate staffing for Policy Development Support. In its review of each OFP, the GNSO Council seeks to ensure that the OFP is providing sufficient personnel and non-personnel resources for the policy development and implementation activities. The FY23 OFP indicates that "the FY23 level of resources is generally expected to be consistent with the current level of staff, assuming that FY22 hiring requests are fulfilled and continuing ability to rely on professional services contractors for additional needs." In FY23 the level of resources allocated to this Functional Activity indicates 36 FTE and \$8.0M USD, which is an increase of 2 FTEs since 2022 and an increase is \$0.9M USD in personnel expenses. The GNSO is pleased to see the planned addition of staff.

The two additional staff will be critically important to ensure that there is adequate support for policy development and implementation efforts. However, neither the FY23 OFP nor FY23 Budget provide insight for their readers into the factors analyzed by ICANN org to determine if staffing is adequate. Moreover, the FY23 OFP correctly identifies that (i) the need for data-driven policymaking results in requests for more robust data collection and analysis as well as external experts to aid in policy development; (ii) policy challenges (such as the SSAD) facing the community are becoming more legally and technically complex; and (iii) the growing complexity of the issues along with their broad impact and diversity of stakeholder interests (e.g., on data privacy and DNS abuse) means that significant time and effort needs to be expended on understanding the issue and multiple viewpoints in order to find consensus. In addition, the GNSO Council would point out that the <u>following work</u> is forecasted for the FY23 time frame:

										22 2023 2024 20 03 04 01 02 03 04 01 02 03 04 01 02		
005	204	UPDP. P2	IFT: Dandardized System for Access & Disclosure - Press 2	09/11/22	05/27/24	Not Diarted	Percel	Contractor		RT. Similarities Desired		
101	N/A	FFDF F2A	IRT: Resolution Data - Phase 26	090732	042823	Not Started	Parrel	Contributor		RT: Requiration Data - Phase JA		
	NA	EPDP. P1	RT: Temporary Specification on aTLD Registration Data - Phase 1	0205/00	06/00/23	In Progress	Redard Schedule	Contributor		IT Terrorary Southates or of D Depicture	a Color Disease I	
	NA	HENG	Request CANN org to develop revised proposal for involing Procedure	10/16/20	101822	On Heat	Contrast do mode	Contributor		Report CAN on to dealer would prove for motion Pool		
	100	WPING	Engage WMAD	020103	042923	Net Started	Passed	Oren		Engage WPIAG		
	NA	WENG	EPOP: Procedure for Handling Whois Conflicts with Privacy Law	062922	10/21/23	Not Started	Parret	Owner		EFOP. Procedure for Handling Whole G		
	NA	107043	IRT: Privacy & Provy Services Accordition Issues	061621	111822	In Program	Redail Schedule	Contractor		IRT: Privacy & Prov Jamices Accendiation Insues		
	NA	157	RT TransformTransitionation of xTLD Resistation Data	081821	11/16/22	In Progress	Revised Schedule	Contributor		IC: Transition/Transitionation of aTLD Registration Data		
	NA	FDA.9T	Receitation Data Acouracy - Scoping Team	001221	11/16/22	In Progress	Orderson and an	Owner		Repibelen Date Ascuracy - Sciging Team		
•	NA	FDA IN	Registration bats Accuracy - Scoping Team Bialt Issue Report on Registration Data Accuracy	120702	059123	Not Started		Owner		Statt Issue Report of Registration Data Accuracy		
	NA	FEM. F1	IRT RPM - Phase 1 Review of RPMs in A1 sTLDs	000102	00/71/23	Not Started	Parrel	Contractor		107 EEM. Change 1 Dealers of STMs in 64 eD for	_	
	NA										_	
		RPM, P2	Drafting Team: Charter on Review of UDRP (incl. Items 2 through 11 of Rec27 Warve1)	040822	110322	Not Started	Parrel	Owner		Drafing Team, Charler on Review of UDID' (red. Items 2 Brough	11 of Rec27 Was one 2 Review of 5	
	NA	1896,92	PDP: RPM - Phase 2 Review of UDRP	11/04/22	110724	Not Diarted	Parrel	Owner				1089
		SubPra	Board New gITLD Subsequent Procedures Operational Design Phase	09/13/31	1013/22	In Progress		Contributor		Board New CTLD Subsequent Procedures Operational Design Pr		
	NA	SubPro	Board New pTLD Exberquent Procedures adopt consernus recommendations	09/22/21	010123	In Progress	On-Schedule	Contributor		Board Mew gTLD Subsequent Procedures adopt concerns		
>	NA	SubPre	IRT: New gTLD Subsequent Procedures	0201/23	03/25/25	Not Started	Parcel	Contributor			r gTED Subseque	ett Phộceduler
	NA	EPDP_XIN	EPOP: Internationalized Domain Manes	06(20)21	061623	In Progress	On-Schedule	Owner		EPOP: Internationalized Domain Names		
ation	NA	PSR, EPR	Develop Expiration Palicy Status Report (nol. Rec27 Wave1 EEOP Item 2 + EFRIP Item2)	08/25/22	05/03/23	Not Ellarfod	Parrel	Contributor		Develop Expiration Policy Status Report (Incl. Rec27		12-89064
den 👘	NA	198,P1	PDP: Transfer Policy Review - Phase 1	02/18/21	12/28/23	In Progress	Or-Schedule	Owner		POP Transfer Policy Review - Phase		
	NA	EPEP_SCRP_JG0	Board. Specific Curative Rights Protections for IBDs adopt consensus recommendations	05/10/22	06/91/22	Not Started	Parred	Contributor		Board: Epecific Curative Rights Pilotections for XDN adopt consensus i		
	NA	EPEP.SCRP.300	IRT: Specific Gurative Rights Protections for ISOs	08/02/22	061423	Not Starled	Farrel	Contributor		PET: Specific Carative Rights Protections for I		
	NA	100,08PM	Board, Curative Rights Protections for ISO/INGOs adkpt concensus recommendations	06/10/22	06/01/22	On Heid	04466	Contributor		Doard Ountry Rights Projections for IQO114QOs adopt opnoreisus re		
	NA	100_ORPH	IRT: Curative Rights Protections for IOO/INOOs	08/02/22	061423	Not Started	Parred	Contributor		PT: Custine Rights Protections for IOD/ING		
	NA	100,84002	Board: Profection of International Organization Names in All gTLDs (Remaining Accoryms)	05/10/22	06/91/22	On Hold	0.101	Contributor		Board Protector of Remellional Departmento Names In All gTLDs (%)		
	NA	100_84002	IRT. PDP. Protection of International Organization Names in All gTLDs (Remaining Assorptio)	08/02/22	061423	Not Started	Parrel	CHERNER		BIT: POP: Presector of International Organic	ion Names in All	gTLDs (Rom
mability	NA	1892	GNSO Council & SG/C Implementation of WS2	05(24)21	01/01/23	In Progress	On-Schedule	Owner		ONSO Dource & SOIC implementation of WE2		
makilly	NA	MSM_Evo	Council to monitor for MSM-Evo implementation assignments	000120	070126	In Progress	On-Schedule	Contributor			Courted to monito	FOR NESALE
	NA	ATR73	Council to monitor for ATRTS implementation assignments	010109	13/13/23	In Progress	On-Schedule	Contributor		Council to monitor for A77073 impiers	rator seeigrme	10
	NA	55 4 2	Council to monitor for 55R2 implementation assignments	0219321	121223	In Program	On-Schedule	Contributor		Council to monitor for \$3942 implement	ation assignment	6
-	NA	Holsen Plat	Holato Raview Piot - ONSO participation	091222	082423	Not Started	Parrel	Contributor		Hotatic Raview Pick - GNSO participation		
tiona	Continuous Improvement	000101	CCOICI Pist Program	09/16/21	07/07/22	In Progress	On-Schedule	Owner		CODICI Plat Program		
tone	Leademinip	GH50.0	GNSO Council - Monthly Meetings	002329	067326	In Progress	On-Schedule	Owner				ONIC
Doors.	Leadership	09850 C	ONID Caurel - Lealership Meetings	001320	061826	In Programs	On Substation	Dener				
tions	Leadership	6450 C	GNEO Council - Action Items	001382	061726	In Program	On-Schedule	Owner				ONSO
firm	Butort	5000	CNSO Standing Committee on FY2H Budget and Operations 2022-2023	1101/22	001522	Not Started	Dented	Owner		GNID Stanling Controlling on FY24 Rulest and Clearate	a 2022-2023	
dorm.	Eastern Reminators	NIC .	ONIO Standing Selection Converting 2021 2022	10/27/21	110822	In Progress	Parrel	Owner		GNSO Standing Selection Committee 2021-2022		
fices	Elections Nominations	550	GNEO Standing Selection Committee 2022-2023	090102	16/23/23	Not Started	Parrel	Owner		GNSD Standing Selection Committee 202	2023	
form	Planning	5F5.2023	ONSO Council - Strategic Planning Session - 2022-2020	10/01/22	012623	Not Diarted	Deret	Owner		ONDO Council Strategic Planning Service - 2022 2023		
fice	CAN Nerlins	CANENTS	CANN'S Research to GAC Advice	001702	07/07/22	Not Started	Parrel	Owner		KCAMPUTY Respond to GAO Advice		
form	KANN Neetron	KANN75	CAN/75 Meeting Planning	060102	0913/22	Not Started	Parret	Owner		CAME/15 Marring Planning		
ione .	CAN Nerice	CANATS	EAMON LONG Meeting	091622	06/20/22	Not Darled	Dented	Dener		CANNOTS ICANON MANERINA		
ione .	CAN Series	CANALE	CAMPUS LOVEN MINING ICAMPUS Researd to GAC Advice	093102	10/11/22	Not Started	Partel	Owner		CAMPS Record to GAC Advice		
lone	ICANN Nersings	ICANNYS ICANNYS	CAMPS Respond to CAC Advice CAMPS Meeting Parring	120102	101122	Not Started	Parrel	Owner		ICANSIN Meeting Planning		
lona lona	CAN Nearge	CANNYS	EAMON MAKING Planning	091623	03/15/23	Not Started	Parel	Owner		CANNIN KOANN Meeting		
lone	ICANN_Neetings	ICANIN78	ICANN'N Respond to GAC Advice	03/23/23	04/13/23	Not Started	Parrel	Owner		CANN'TE Respond to DAO Advice		
lone	KANN, Neelings	IGANN/7	ICANN/7 Meeting Planning	040123	06/98/23	Not Started	Parrel	Owner		CANN/77 Meeting Planning		
dom	ICANN, Meetings	ICANNUT7	ICANN/71CANNI Meeting	06/09/23	061823	Not Started	Passel	Owner		CANNO7 KANNI Sheesing		
	ICANN Interface	IOANNY77	ICANN?? Respond to GAC Advice	097923	03/06/23	Not Started		Owner		ICANV77 Barpond to GAC Advice		

In light of these risk factors, the GNSO Council is happy to engage with ICANN org on the future work of the GNSO, the factors examined by ICANN org for personnel resource decisions and best-practices for project management staffing.

- Planning at ICANN
 - OFP Issue 2. Strategic priority should be given to collaboration between the GNSO Council, ICANN Org's Policy Development Support and the ICANN Board and Community on prioritization and planning for anticipated future work. In its comments on the FY22 OFP, the GNSO Council noted that there had been no increase in the FY22 OFP as it pertains to resources dedicated to collaboration and planning for future ICANN Policy Work. Like the FY22 OFP, the FY23 OFP provides no detail concerning resources dedicated to planning because "Resources for this initiative are included within the functional activities of the financial plan". These activities are especially critical as in FY23 ICANN will implement the draft prioritization plan during the planning process of the FY24 OFP. The GNSO Council was pleased to see that additional resources for the Policy Development and Advice Functional Activity. However, no further details are provided as to where these additional resources will be drawn from, such as the SFICR, the IT budget or contingency budget.

Specific Comments related to the draft FY23 Operating Plan & Budget:

In the GNSO Council's comment on the FY23 Budget, the following issues were identified:

- Policy Development and Advice
 - Budget Issue 1. Maintain adequate non-personnel resources for Policy Development Support. In the GNSO Council's comment on the FY22 Budget, we pointed out that the initiatives, tools and resources associated with PDP 3.0 should be explicitly individualized in the activities to enable the GNSO Council to adequately evaluate whether the recommended changes associated with PDP 3.0 were being adequately funded. As mentioned in the General Comments, the GNSO Council acknowledges that most of PDP 3.0 has been implemented and that its various tools and resources are covered by the Policy Development and Support Functional Activity section of the FY23 Budget, and, in particular, the Technical Services and Contingency subsections. The GNSO Council will continue to provide a review and analysis of these budget sections on a recurring annual basis.
 - Budget Issue 2. Maintain adequate staffing for Policy Development Support. In the GNSO's comment on the FY22 Budget, the GNSO Council remarked that with respect to Policy Development the total budget for FY21 was the same as for FY20, \$6.9M and 35 FTE. The GNSO Council was pleased to see that 36 FTE are budgeted. In the joint meeting between the GNSO Council's Standing Committee on Operations and Budget (SCBO) and the ccNSO Strategic and

Operational Planning Committee (SOPC), there was discussion with the ICANN Finance & Planning team concerning these committees gaining a better understanding of the process and factors that ICANN org undertakes to determine staffing needs. The SCBO looks forward to engaging with ICANN Finance and planning and the SOPC on this topic in the future.

Conclusion

The GNSO Council appreciates this opportunity to share our perspectives on these important issues. As the GNSO is a part of the Empowered Community we look forward to reviewing all inputs from the public comment process which addresses ICANN's broader strategy and budget. Finally, the GNSO Council would be happy to answer any clarifying questions that you may have regarding the contents of this document.

Yours sincerely,

Philippe Fouquart GNSO Council Chair