

Note to GNSO Council in preparation for Special Council Meeting to be held 15 March, 2010
Evaluation Team Recommendations - AoC Review Team [Accountability & Transparency]

Background Note

The Evaluation Team [ET] members are as follows: Caroline Greer [RySG], Adrian Kinderis / Tim Ruiz [RgrSG], Wolf-Ulrich Knoben [CSG], Bill Drake [NCSG] and Olga Cavalli [NCAs].

The ET met on 11th March to a) try to identify which applicants the Stakeholder Groups [SG] were selecting for their “allocated slots,” absent any official notification of same; b) identify which applicants would be standing for election to the ‘Unaffiliated’ and ‘Open’ slots; c) allocate these applicants between the two slots, based on the process agreed in the GNSO-approved Action Plan of 18 February; and d) determine whether the ET could reach consensus to recommend top candidates to the Council for each of these slots.

The purpose of the Special Council meeting of 15 March is to determine who, if any, candidates will be endorsed by the Council for the two open slots

Per the approved process, up to 6 candidates will be forwarded by the GNSO Council to the Selectors. However, it should also be noted that it was decided at the ICANN Board meeting of 12th March that GNSO allocations would be increased from 1 to 4.

Given the low number of candidates overall [12], the ET noted that it could be challenging to apply the diversity rules to which the Council had agreed. Nevertheless, Council members should consider diversity when endorsing / voting, particularly if a first round of voting does not result in a simple majority endorsement / vote.

Allocation of Candidates

Deferred Candidate

Eric Brunner-Williams, US [NB: *The Stability and Security RT was Eric’s first choice*].

Allocated Candidates – one per SG

Brian Cute, US – RySG
Warren Adelman, US – RgrSG
Olivier Muron, FR - CSG
Willie Currie, SA – NCSG

[NB: *This provides 2 US, 1 European and 1 African candidate, giving rise to representation of 3 geographic regions but no gender diversity*].

Unaffiliated Slot – for Council vote

Elaine Pruis, US
S. S. Kshatriya, India

Open Slot – for Council vote

Ron Andruff, US

Mike O'Connor, US

Mark Bohannon, US

Victoria McEvedy, UK

Hakikur Rahman, Bangladesh

ET Recommendations for the Unaffiliated and Open Slots / Council Action

For the **Unaffiliated Slot**:

- RySG would support Elaine
- NCSG would support Elaine
- RgrSG and CSG have reservations on both candidates
- NCAs may support Elaine [*NB no final confirmation received*]

Council Action: ET members are divided on whether to recommend that the Council vote for Elaine. Councilors must now vote on their preferred candidate. A simple majority vote of both Houses will secure victory for a candidate. Alternatively, the Council could vote in such a manner that neither candidate gets a majority. If the first round of voting fails to produce a positive result, a second round will be conducted. The outcome of the second round would be definitive.

Considerations / Recommendations: Elaine is knowledgeable and would bring to the RT a view from outside the existing SG alignments. It is also worth recalling that the Council adopted rules requiring gender and geographic diversity 'if the candidate pool allows' along with procedures to redress inadequate diversity.

For the **Open Slot**:

RySG supports Ron but could support some of the other candidates as well

RgrSG supports Ron and Mark

CSG supports Ron and Mark

NCSG supports Hakikur

Council Action: ET members gave the broadest support to Ron and Mark, although Hakikur also received some support. Councilors must now vote on their preferred candidate. A simple majority vote of both Houses will secure victory for a candidate. Alternatively, the Council could vote in such a manner that neither candidate gets a majority. If the first round of voting fails to produce a positive result, a second round will be conducted. The outcome of the second round would be definitive.

Considerations / Recommendations: Both Mark and Ron are US males. The addition of a third US male (alongside Brian and Warren, who are nominated in the allocated slots) would likely raise significant questions in relation to the diversity requirements and the various considerations made by the Council. Hakikur would strengthen the geographic diversity of the group but garnered less support in the ET overall.