

**JIG  
TRANSCRIPTION  
Tuesday 18 February 2014 at 1200 UTC**

Note: The following is the output of transcribing from an audio recording of the JIG meeting on Tuesday 18 February 2014 at 1200 UTC. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases it is incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages or transcription errors. It is posted as an aid to understanding the proceedings at the meeting, but should not be treated as an authoritative record. The audio is also available at: <http://audio.icann.org/gnso/gnso-jig-20140218-en.mp3>

On page:<http://gnso.icann.org/calendar#feb>  
(transcripts and recordings are found on the calendar page)

Attendees:

Edmon Chung, RySG, Co-Chair  
Young Eum Lee

Apologies:

Chris Dillon  
Jonathan Shea

ICANN Staff:

Bart Boswinkel  
Mary Wong  
Nathalie Peregrine

Coordinator: This afternoon's conference call is now being recorded.

Nathalie Peregrine: Thank you ever so much, (Tim). Good morning, good afternoon, good evening everybody. This is the JIG call on the 18th of February, 2014. On the call today we have Edmon Chung and Young-Eum Lee. We have apologies from Jonathan Shea and Chris Dillon. And from staff we have Mary Wong, Bart Boswinkel and myself, Nathalie Peregrine.

I'd like to remind you all to please state your names before speaking for transcription purposes. Thank you very much and over to you, Edmon.

Edmon Chung: Thank you, Nathalie. This is Edmon. And thank you, everyone, for joining. Since we don't really have a lot of people joined, but at least we have myself and we - have us as the co chairs joined. So I sent around a very brief kind of agenda but mainly we just wanted to discuss a little bit about the next steps for this group which is from Singapore - no, no sorry from - where were we before?

Bart Boswinkel: Buenos Aires.

Edmon Chung: Buenos Aires, sorry. From the Buenos Aires meeting especially at the GNSO ccNSO Council joint meeting we had a little bit of discussion about the kind of going forward of this group. And what we wanted to try to do is between then and the Singapore ICANN meeting to perhaps assess and present some of the ideas for moving forward on the issues that we have worked on.

So, yes, because we probably don't have a lot of people to discuss the items but we should at least talk a little bit about the sessions that are being planned in Singapore. And perhaps to quickly talk a little bit about what we - I guess Young-Eum, you and I had a very brief conversation in Buenos Aires as well on this. And perhaps how we can help drive the group to ask for sort of - report back to the two councils for next steps.

So I guess we'll start - Bart, if you could help start with a quick update, I guess, on the joint session that is being planned for universal acceptance in Singapore ICANN and where we are with that. Oh and one thing just I guess for the record the two respective councils have adopted the - our final report on universal acceptance of IDN TLDs. And I believe that has been - with that it would have been sent to the Board. So I guess that's just to note that that has happened.

So, Bart, if you could update us or you have any other...

((Crosstalk))

Bart Boswinkel: Yes, this is Bart. Yeah, this is Bart for the record. So first of all the chairs of the ccNSO and GNSO Council submitted the final report around two weeks ago jointly both to the Chair of the ICANN Board and to - and we copied in Fadi and Cyrus Namazi from the GDD. So that's the first step.

Secondly around, say, a couple of weeks ago ICANN initiated or re-launched its project program around universal acceptance. So the project leader is Francisco Arias. And in the meantime they have hired a consultant, Edward Lewis who is assisting Francisco and the community in getting universal acceptance going.

But this is still - they are still trying to think through what is a reasonable approach in facilitating universal acceptance. And as a result and because Mary and I were in touch or as main support staff of the JIG we suggested to them to have a combined session at the Singapore meeting as we've already scheduled a JIG meeting in case it was needed.

And what I know, say, and what we discussed say Francisco and Edward, is that they want to discuss with the broader community, including members of the JIG and the JIG itself, what is the proper role for ICANN regarding universal acceptance.

So if it would be a facilitator how to structure the effort and how ICANN could provide resources to promote and facilitate universal acceptance. And if it would play a central point of contact is how to mark progress, etcetera. And it's definitely clear that both Francisco and Edward really, really want to have input from the community so especially the JIG members. And the JIG report is a very good starting point for ICANN's efforts to, yeah, facilitate universal acceptance so all came together at once.

And so going forward and looking at the meeting itself to date the only thing we've done is more or less, and Francisco will do this, is schedule a combined session for around 90 minutes so part of it will be time, if needed, for the JIG to discuss what they want to propose to the two councils and probably most time will be dedicated to a discussion around universal acceptance and to define ICANN's role in moving ahead and how the community should and could be involved in that initiative.

So that with regard to the Singapore session and where we are with regard to looking at universal acceptance. That's it.

Edmon Chung: Thank you, Bart, for the update. I guess as a quick response I think at least to the restart of this program is very good to hear and this is perhaps the third or fourth time this has restarted in a way. But I think it's probably still important.

One of the things that this group, I guess, at least myself have learned and during the discussion this came up as well, one of the things is that universal acceptance is more than IDNs, it's also about - especially about long TLDs. But by focusing on the IDN TLDs that gets the whole community behind us. That gets the whole ICANN community behind us rather than a more - a business or commercial interest-driven area.

So that's, I guess, a more important thing that - you know, that I guess the JIG report also contributes to.

((Crosstalk))

Bart Boswinkel: Edmon. Edmon...

Edmon Chung: Please.

Bart Boswinkel: Just, say, I was a little bit incorrect. It is truly about, say, the ICANN project, say, from Francisco and Edward is around universal acceptance of TLDs, new TLDs so it's broader than the focus area of the JIG. So...

Edmon Chung: Right.

Bart Boswinkel: ...sorry for the correction.

Edmon Chung: Yeah, so that's - I just wanted to point out that. And the - and my point is, just in case it got lost, my point is that the two of them, even though it seems like a sub part of the bigger universal acceptance, you know, the result of the question of whether ICANN and what ICANN should do is probably going to be quite different. And that's the observation from the discussion that have been had on these topics from previous discussions.

But anyway that - I think it is a good thing to join the two and have that discussion and have that distinction in, you know, when we actually have the discussion. So I guess I'll wait for you and perhaps Francisco to kind of take the lead and try to start develop the agenda or are - is the team looking for us also to be more proactive in making suggestions about region?

Bart Boswinkel: I think - what my suggestion to Francisco will be that we at least inform the two - the co chairs of the JIG so they can report back to the JIG itself but at least have an understanding as it will be a combined session.

Edmon Chung: Right. We are about a month - a little bit more than a month from Singapore ICANN. So I just wonder if we want to make this a session that we would invite, you know, maybe somebody to talk with us, well, and also adding to that and this kind of flows into what I want to quickly discuss today as well is that wearing a different hat the - at the ALAC side of things the ALAC IDN working group is also planning some follow-on work on the JIG report and on the broader topic of universal acceptance.

And the ALAC IDN Working Group meeting in Singapore will also have a dedicated - pretty much the bulk of the session's time on this topic. While I think it should exist separately, you know, it would be a good thing - I just want to let everyone know that that will be happening s well.

And I don't - for that particular one I don't see any reason why it needs to be combined. I think it will be talking kind of a little bit different aspect of it. And - but that - but the reason I bring it up is not only just to advertise it but also that the preparations for getting some speakers there and for making sure that we have the relevant people to participate in the discussion probably should happen soon. And I just want to...

((Crosstalk))

Bart Boswinkel: Oh yes, yes, but it was more, say, that's why we contact the co chairs last week is first of all suggested and say see how it - how the JIG feels about it. They don't want this to be either a JIG-run session or a ICANN staff-run session. I think universal acceptance is a combined effort of all those who are interested and we need to start working to combining all these efforts into one effort.

Young-Eum Lee: Basically I agree. But, Edmon, you can hear me, right?

Bart Boswinkel: Yeah, yeah, I can hear you.

((Crosstalk))

Young-Eum Lee: Yeah, yeah, yeah, yeah, okay. The JIG focuses mostly on IDNs the issue of universal acceptance is - can be more general I think, I mean, that we need to firefight that there is a difference in scope but that we are going to focus on ideas and - and if it works with IDNs it will work with pretty much everything. So I think that's one way to go.

But as for the inclusion of more people, I mean, I see a lot of names here but not - but they are not here. So, I mean, I'm wondering should each community take the lead or will ICANN just make the announcement?

Bart Boswinkel: It's probably - Edmon, do you - so I think it's as...

((Crosstalk))

Bart Boswinkel: ...it's easier, say, that, say, the JIG - at least from, say, that ICANN announces it but let's say more or less co-sponsored by the JIG and maybe even the ALAC IDN group, say, with regard to the universal acceptance that you have all the people in one room and not try to - so it's really topic-driven than anything else and community-driven.

Edmon Chung: This is Edmon. Yeah, I agree very much with, Bart, your - the observation that also - I guess my question is really whether - so I guess we're waiting for Francisco to take the lead and we'll hear more from him about how he wants to organize it and then we'll probably try to, you know, also bring in other...

Bart Boswinkel: Yeah.

Edmon Chung: ...others so. Okay so I guess...

((Crosstalk))

Edmon Chung: If it's okay I'll leave it to - we can leave it to you, Bart, to liaise...

Bart Boswinkel: Yeah, that's fine. Yeah, I'll report back to the JIG.

Edmon Chung: Sounds good.

Young-Eum Lee: Great.

Edmon Chung: Okay so in that case I guess we - the only other item is really about this particular group. So I guess a quick note is that, Young-Eum, you and I had a - well we were at the joint council meeting and right after that we had a very brief conversation on this.

And it seems like the direction would probably to go back and recommend that following up work should probably be done but a kind of new group should be chartered so that the JIG could, in essence, wrap its work up.

Young-Eum Lee: Okay.

Edmon Chung: And I've since then actually discussed it with the - the group at ALAC as well. And it seems like there is some energy to get this work started as well. So perhaps - I'm kind of leaning towards a direction where we would kind of recommend further work that needs to be done especially in supporting the implementation of some of the things.

But perhaps a joint group that would include ALAC or even GAC, if they're willing, to get started and perhaps the ALAC group should - could take the lead in drafting a kind of charter on the - on this new group. That is my kind of latest thinking on this. I don't know, Young-Eum, or Bart or others if you have any thoughts.

Young-Eum Lee: Basically I agree with what Edmon said and, I mean, we should try to start a new group. And ALAC if there are people interested, I mean, and the GAC because now - because of the Internet governance issue everyone's talking about multistakeholder and so this would be a good way to go.

Bart Boswinkel: This is Bart. Say an alternative - so I've been thinking about it as well is an alternative, say, having a joint group is - I think is one scenario, one way forward. Maybe as an alternative start thinking about creating a kind of, yeah, I would call it a platform.

It's more or less again bringing together all the interests in universal acceptance and have a, say, have say the ICANN group, say, act as a kind of secretariat and use ICANN meetings to at least have a full discussion with not just the ICANN community but maybe also outsiders and to really start working on solution of - or resolving the issues around universal acceptance one by one.

So what I saw in the course of the JIG is, for example, that a lot of IDN ccTLDs have a lot of experience around universal acceptance, or in this sense, a negative experience on the non-acceptance.

And it's - what needs to be done probably is there needs to be an avenue, a channel or however you want to call it where these kind of experience - and, Edmon, you had the same with dotAsia and probably you will see the same in future with some of the IDN TLDs is where these experience are not shared so much among the community itself but are shared with the outside world.

And I think in trying to create a more broader encompassing group than just thinking in terms of, SO/AC joint groups will be more effective.

Mary Wong: This is Mary. Can...

((Crosstalk))

Edmon Chung: Please.

Mary Wong: Okay. Thanks, Edmon. And, you know, I was just thinking through this - I'm relatively new to supporting this work, as you guys know. But and, Edmon, I think you're going to be at (APIC) later this week and next week, right? So there's going to be an ICANN update session...

Edmon Chung: Yeah.

Mary Wong: ...that - I think you know about this - that's being coordinated out of the Singapore office. And I'm actually going to be there for the policy team and universal acceptance is one of the topics we wanted to bring up to the community.

So one of the things maybe that we need to sort of coordinate is looking at some viewpoints, perspectives, comments from folks within the ICANN community, including ALAC, especially ALAC since they're interested in taking things forward, but coordinating that with other parts of the Internet community, the technical community and so forth.

And it may be that after (APIC) and after a number of these other sessions, whether in Asia Pacific or elsewhere there can be some coalescing around specific next steps. So to the extent that your ALAC wants to take the lead in maybe creating a document with some more concrete proposals that take us forward they could take some of this feedback and, in the next few months, for example, help the community figure out where it wants to go before forming a joint group. That's sort of what I'm thinking.

Edmon Chung: Thank you, Mary. This is Edmon. I think both of - I'll respond quickly on Bart's idea first. I think that's a great idea. In fact you were kind of speaking my mind. I think we are very much done with having this discussion at a kind of policy level. We need to switch it into a take action mode and that's - and calling it kind of platform or, you know, finding a right way to call it is quite important.

Which ties in with what, Mary, you're saying. I think what I'm leaning towards is really, you know, if we could have a - I think ICANN is a great place to come together but, you know, we can - we must then take action down to other places.

One of the really good experience I've seen is how the RIRs worked on advocacy of IPv6. And we should certainly tag along those lines because

ISPs and those providers are also part of the target for universal acceptance. So, you know, having the discussion at (APRIC) and where AP needs as well is certainly useful and, again, I'll be there.

And in fact overall the - I think this - that's exactly the reason why I think, you know, this needs to move beyond the two SOs and also even why ALAC it would be good to be involved because a lot of the ALSs actually do work with the RIRs to do IPv6 work - advocacy of IPv6.

And that's the network that, you know, we can probably leverage. But having ICANN or ICANN meetings as a central point to, you know, see how - where we are at, you know, over the course of time would be - would be a good model I think. That's sort of the idea.

Bart Boswinkel: Edmon, this is Bart again.

((Crosstalk))

Edmon Chung: Bart, please.

Bart Boswinkel: And I think, say, going back to what I said around the introduction, I think this is a discussion Francisco and Edward are looking for is how to best structure and how to use the resources available the most effectively and efficiently and turn this into a combined effort of the whole community and inviting outsiders as well to it.

Say, we - as a JIG we had the very good experience with Jonathan - Jonathan Frakes because he was on the working group that you can see there is spin-off. And I think that type of efforts and - should be encouraged to say the least.

Edmon Chung: Yeah. Absolutely.

((Crosstalk))

Young-Eum Lee: I mean, I think that's what I wanted to kind of emphasize the fact that we need to try to get the people who can do, I mean, who can deal with the specifics of - the technical stuff and others not just the policy. So, I mean, I think we're kind of in agreement but we're saying it in a different way.

Bart Boswinkel: Edmon?

Edmon Chung: Yes. Bart, please go ahead.

Bart Boswinkel: May I make a suggestion? Say, as I follow up with Francisco that, say, before the next call we come with a - say a rough sketch how this could look like so - to share with the JIG and have a discussion on the next call with the JIG. And if everybody's reasonably in agreement suggest it to the councils.

And maybe that's a way of dealing with universal acceptance as well because there you see a high level of ICANN activity -ICANN staff activity. And I think that most people from the JIG are involved in the IDN, you know, the various IDN variant projects as well.

Edmon Chung: This is Edmon. I think that's a great idea. I'd like to emphasize one point which I made earlier as well. Again, if we think about the - what ICANN should do or shouldn't do, you know, about universal acceptance the answers might be very different if you ask about a general gTLD kind of issue versus if you focus on IDN TLDs.

You know, I'll be pretty straightforward about this, if you ask the community whether we should - ICANN should support helping like making sure that dotGoogle works around the world I would say no. I think that should be commercial interest-driven.

But if you talk about whether it's a - ICANN should spend the resources behind just coordination on dotIdn I think that is something that ICANN should spend resources to work on. So, you know, just to be very direct on what I mean by if you ask the question about the general overall versus if you focus on IDN TLDs the answer could be quite different.

So with that I guess, yes, we'll - I guess we'll wait - we'll wait to hear back from you, Bart, both on the agenda for the Singapore meeting and perhaps for our next meeting in a month's time just before this meeting to have a - kind of a sense of what - maybe a suggestion to - so that we could go back to the councils as well.

Bart Boswinkel: Yeah.

Young-Eum Lee: Agreed. This is Young-Eum Lee.

Edmon Chung: Good. And that I guess brings us...

((Crosstalk))

Edmon Chung: ...the end of the meeting. Any other things people want to bring up?

Bart Boswinkel: No not really, not from my end.

Edmon Chung: Okay. Hearing none I guess thank you, everyone.

Bart Boswinkel: Okay thank you. Bye bye.

Young-Eum Lee: Thank you.

Mary Wong: Thanks, Edmon.

END