

GNSO Council meeting 15 December 2016 Adobe Connect Chat Transcript

Marika Konings:Welcome to the GNSO Council Meeting of 15 December 2016

Amr Elsadr:hi all.

David Olive:Welcome All Hi Amr

Stefania Milan:there is a sstrange echo when you speak, Heather

Stefania Milan:(hello everyone!)

Julf Helsingius:I liked the piano in the background...

Michele Neylon:afternoon

Carlos Gutierrez:Chopin?

Wolf-Ulrich Knoblen:Hi Mozarts!

Michele Neylon:more consolidation in Europe announced

https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=http-3A_www.internetnews.me_2016_12_15_united-2Dinternet-2Dacquires-2Dstrato_&d=DglFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJP6wrcrwlI3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd_FX3f4MVgkEli9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgSyXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM_uTSDzggG&m=06Ndk27ddg62I7n7LRb8osjMnXXz_d1P09amzrdt-D8&s=j3dHiSLCEphQHAMfCvoVBe7x_G2H_cYURJnDPJvvxxg&e=

Heather Forrest:Nathalie - I note Stefania's comment above. Has anyone else had trouble hearing me?

Amr Elsadr:@Heather: Sound good to me.

Michele Neylon:heather is loud and clear

Paul McGrady -IPC:Good morning/afternoon/evening all!

Amr Elsadr:Hi Paul.

Stefania Milan:I am on the phone bridge but with much echo

Stefania Milan:also when Glen speaks

Julf Helsingius:no echo here

Julf Helsingius:sound just fine

Erika Mann:I'm on the phone, safer from where I am \

Nathalie Peregrine:Stefania, would you like us to dial out to you again?

Stefania Milan:oh, it stopped now.

Nathalie Peregrine:great

marilia maciel:I am here don't know if you could hear me

marilia maciel:noisy place

Martin Silva:Here!

Martin Silva:Hi all

Donna Austin, RySG:Thank you Heather

Glen de Saint Gery:Erika Mann has provided a SOI

Philip Corwin:Good day. Thanks Nathalie for sending that link

Nathalie Peregrine:Martin Silva Valent's SOI (temporary alternate for Ed

Morris): https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_community.icann.org_x_JYxlAw&d=DglFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJP6wrcrwlI3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd_FX3f4MVgkEli9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgSyXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM_uTSDzggG&m=06Ndk27ddg62I7n7LRb8osjMnXXz_d1P09amzrdt-D8&s=V8-7yrH-7sbKvnO8XC-VLyTi37F0T-THUlodqJjmJuQ&e=

Erika Mann:Take it off, I prefer

Amr Elsadr:I think that's fair.

Marika Konings:And to explain, the action items usually cover items that directly come out of a Council meeting and are not captured by an ongoing project on the project list.

Heather Forrest:Amr - I see your hand -

Amr Elsadr:Thanks Heather.

Heather Forrest:Apologies, Amr, for not seeing your hand sooner

Marika Konings:According to the motion, yes

Marika Konings:"Appointed Co-Chair and Member to the CCWG – Auction Proceeds"

Mary Wong:In other words, the GNSO co-chair is the fifth GNSO member.

Donna Austin, RySG:Heather, we don't seem to have a seconder for this motion. I am happy to be the retroactive seconder.

Amr Elsadr:@Marika @Mary: Whoops. Thanks. :)

Glen de Saint Gery:Is this motion seconded?

Amr Elsadr:T&T sounds like TNT. :)

Keith Drazek:I will be happy to second this motion.

Heather Forrest:Thanks, Keith, noted

Stephanie Perrin:test

Nathalie Peregrine:received stephanie

Stephanie Perrin:Thanks!

Amr Elsadr:https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_community.icann.org_display_gTLDRDS_Additional-2BKey-2BInputs&d=DgIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd_FX3f4MVgkEli9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgysXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM_uTSDzggG&m=06Ndk27ddg62I7n7LRb8osjMnXXz_d1P09amzrdt-D8&s=kxUnTbnSGpok-RlxRNjYr5r6ucwj-NLC2LCYZWI6lc&e=

Keith Drazek:Amr's email to the list on Tuesday was very helpful in explaining this background. Thanks for your leadership on this, Amr!

Amr Elsadr:Jim Glavin's input was also extremely helpful. He was very active on all of these groups, and chaired the IRD EWG.

Paul McGrady -IPC:I think it makes sense to think through Amr's comments and then respond on the list.

Julf Helsingius:I agree

Erika Mann:+1 Agree

Keith Drazek:I'm fine either way.

Amr Elsadr:I don't believe we need a vote, but fine either way.

Paul McGrady -IPC:Thanks Amr.

Amr Elsadr:Thank you all, and apologies again for weighing in so late.

Erika Mann:Can staff resend final doc with all the comments please?

Mary Wong:@Erika, yes, we will - with a reminder of the final deadline :)

Erika Mann:Thank you Mary!

Marika Konings:I have the latest text in relation to the abuse section and I can pull the original draft up separately

Philip Corwin:I'm not seeing any document on display

Heather Forrest:Phil - document is headed "IPC language GAC Com.pdf"

Heather Forrest:Can you see this on the AC screen?
Marika Konings:Phil, you may need to restart AC if you do not see the document
Marika Konings:it is what Paul sent to the list just prior to the start of this meeting
Donna Austin, RySG:Happy to second this motion
Heather Forrest:Thanks, Donna
Heather Forrest:After Paul's introduction of the motion, I'll open discussion with the queue (Donna and Michele)
Michele Neylon:roger
Paul McGrady -IPC:Thanks Donna!
Heather Forrest:Outstanding result, everyone. Great work
Rubens Kuhl (RySG):Nathalie, I sent a phone for dial-out in the private chat, so if you please could take a look at it...
Keith Drazek:"Formal GAC Advice" vs. "the GAC advises" are indeed two different things, as Michele notes.
Donna Austin, RySG:Thanks Michele for the comments on the challenges regarding abuse.
Marika Konings>Note, updated version of GAC Communique is now up on the screen as well with the latest language for item 2 included.
Michele Neylon:Donna - it's one of my pet projects
Amr Elsadr:I'm not sure I understand the concern.
Rubens Kuhl (RySG):I don't think it does...
James Bladel:I don't see those as incompatible
Michele Neylon:they're two different things
Amr Elsadr:@James: +1
Donna Austin, RySG:@James, perhaps incompatible is a better phrase
Michele Neylon:our concern is ICANN (or anyone else) telling us what abuse is etc
Michele Neylon:BC concern is about what ICANN reports on
Michele Neylon:now we probably don't 100% agree with the BC on this
Michele Neylon:but they're two different things
Donna Austin, RySG:The GNSO Council observes that ICANN is only one party to its contracts; the others are registries or registrars. It is inappropriate for one party to a contract to unilaterally define enforcement standards for abuse reporting.
Paul McGrady -IPC:Sorry about my lack of eloquence. Its early and cold here!!
Paul McGrady -IPC:Thanks Phil. Thanks Michele.
Michele Neylon:I think we agree on what we disagree on
Rubens Kuhl (RySG):Thanks Phil.
Michele Neylon:such an ICANNesque phrase
Michele Neylon:my mammy would be proud
James Bladel:Confirmed.
Rubens Kuhl (RySG):Yes
Philip Corwin:@Paul--almost as early here, and the coldest day of the winter in DC

James Bladel:Great work on this, Paul, Donna, Phil, Rubens, Michele, et al.
Stefania Milan:thanks for that webminar. Very useuul
Stefania Milan:*useful
Heather Forrest:Fine to go through resolved, W-U
Susan Kawaguchi:sorry for being late I must have had the wrong time on my calendar
Stephanie Perrin:It's early out there...
Paul McGrady -IPC:Thank you W-U!
Donna Austin, RySG:Agree Amr: many thanks to Jen for her work on this long-running effort.
Stephanie Perrin:The scheduling was v difficult in Hyderabad. I wanted to attend but could not.
Wolf-Ulrich Knobn:Hyderabad session was even not so poorly attended as others have been
Rubens Kuhl (RySG):Hyderabad scheduling issues was much more common than Malaria, Dengue or Zika.
Rubens Kuhl (RySG):(were)
Amr Elsadr:My impression was that despite poor attendance, lots of comments were submitted throughout the review, which were always taken into consideration.
Amr Elsadr:I mean comments by the GNSO's community/SGs/Cs.
Susan Kawaguchi:yes here
Susan Kawaguchi:but cant dial in
James Bladel:Yes
Susan Kawaguchi:phil has my proxy
Susan Kawaguchi:aye
Wolf-Ulrich Knobn:aye for the proxy, too
Stefania Milan:a more substantive review would be very useful, thanks!
Wolf-Ulrich Knobn:Stefania, I hope you can join in 2018 the latest!
Susan Kawaguchi:glen could you dial out to me? 650 387 3904? no on is answering on the regular number?
Nathalie Peregrine:dialing you shortly Susan
Wolf-Ulrich Knobn:what does "effectiveness of the RDS" mean? In which relation?
Rubens Kuhl (RySG):I wonder if we could activate the Empowered Community to get a decision to reduce scope for this edition of the review.
Stephanie Perrin:yes
Stephanie Perrin:exactly, Erika
Keith Drazek:The bylaw language says the RT "will consider" the guidelines. Have they been updated since 2013?
Stephanie Perrin:No
Stephanie Perrin:They were reviewed, but they have not dealt with the fundamental problems of TBDF which Erika has very well described.
Stephanie Perrin:It is a hard problem, particularly given the disparity of constitutional protections in different states, which impact criminal law enforcement.

Heather Forrest:Keith, we can give this another 5 minutes or so, but given that it doesn't require action today, I suggest we continue the discussion on the list after this meeting

Stephanie Perrin:Sorry to slow us down

Amr Elsadr:@Keith @Susan: Thanks for flagging this. Important for the Council to get this right.

James Bladel:I think we're already beyond that. :)

Paul McGrady -IPC:I think we need some time to go back to our constituencies on this - an important issue for sure.

Stephanie Perrin:agree with Paul

Heather Forrest:I will propose a timeline that takes all this into account

Susan Kawaguchi:Thanks Amr

Stephanie Perrin:The problem is item number 8, really. Not sure how we do anything qualitative on this that will not intersect with the RDS PDP work. But will try to get my head around it better.

Stefania Milan:+1 to Stephanie's concern over item 8

Paul McGrady -IPC:Timeline is then?: Out to our C's and SG's today, Councilor comments to list by Tuesday. Harmonization work on Wed/Thurs; final product to Staff by COB Thursday LA time?

Donna Austin, RySG:@Stephanie, I hope that some coordination between the two groups could help address your concern on 8

Paul McGrady -IPC:Agree Heather. Christmas is already here and its only going to get more here...

Stefania Milan:sound reasonable, Heather

Stephanie Perrin:I think my concerns could be addressed by a strong statement on avoiding duplication, will try to draft a proposal.

Donna Austin, RySG:Is there an expectation that the RT will not have people who are on the PDP WG?

Keith Drazek:I will be happy to coordinate feedback for a next draft.

Susan Kawaguchi:@ Donna I am sure there will be overlap of WG members on this RDS

Stephanie Perrin:@Donna, I believe it is one of the questions that appears on the template. I have not checked the list lately but was concerned that we dont have enough overlap....Susan has volunteered but she can't do everything, she is a co-chair on the RDS as well.

Paul McGrady -IPC:Thanks Keith!

Donna Austin, RySG:thanks Susan and Stephanie

Amr Elsadr:Agree on decoupling. We're late on making appointments to that RT as well.

Marika Konings:and maximum of 7 nominations by the GNSO

Marika Konings:and the GNSO also has the ability to endorse any that did not request GNSO endorsement, so the pool is even larger ;-)

Amr Elsadr:max of 7, then filter down to 3, right?

Mary Wong:If the GNSO nominates 3, all 3 will get spots. If more than 3, the others are not guaranteed spots (or so I understand; happy to be corrected)

Amr Elsadr:@Mary: Yes..., my understanding as well. Which would confirm that

eventually, we need a list of 3.

Susan Kawaguchi:happy to help on selection

Mary Wong:@Amr, not necessarily - the GNSO can nominate >3, it's just that the "extras" won't necessarily get on.

Keith Drazek:But the "extras" could get selected for diversity.

Marika Konings:@Mary - only if the GNSO makes very clear that the 3 are the guaranteed ones - if it selects a list of 7, it is not clear what would happen (or how 3 would be chosen by the SO/AC leadership)

Stephanie Perrin:I would volunteer but have put my name forward so have a COI I guess.

Mary Wong:@Marika, yes

James Bladel:@Heather. Yep, perfect

Marika Konings:@Keith - but only if there are places left. If all SO/ACs put forward 3 candidates, the maximum # of members for the RT will have been reached.

James Bladel:Yes, correct.

Amr Elsadr:@Mary: Ah..., I think I get what you're saying. I've understood the bylaws to mean that the final say on 3 of the potential 7 will be a decision for the GNSO, which isn't the same as saying that the GNSO will have at least 3 of its applicants on the RT. Need to figure that out.

Keith Drazek:Ok thanks Marika

Susan Kawaguchi:@ Amr, I understood the process to be we send over our top 3 candidates which will automatically be accepted on the RT and then provide 4 other candidates that might be selected if there are seats available

Amr Elsadr:@Susan: That was my understanding as well, but we may need to confirm this.

Amr Elsadr:This is still new, so still figuring it out. :)

Mary Wong:@Susan, @Amr, I believe that was the gist of the SO/AC/SG/C discussion on SSR2 in Hyderabad.

Wolf-Ulrich Knoblen:@Susan: "might be" is correct. It's up to the SO/AC leaders together

Donna Austin, RySG:thanks James

Keith Drazek:Sounds like we should work with our SGs and Cs to identify potential high interest topics.

Paul McGrady -IPC:One person's high interest topic is another person's chance to grab lunch...

Rubens Kuhl (RySG):Lunch is a high interest topic by definition...

Donna Austin, RySG:@Michele, I don't think we have that information.

Marika Konings>Note that the deadline for submission of High Interest Topics is 23 December. Are there any that the GNSO Council would like to put forward?

Donna Austin, RySG:@Marika, are any of the PDP WGs likely to be in a public comment period in Copenhagen? Perhaps a HIT could be developed around the public comment?

Keith Drazek:12/23 is a ridiculous deadline for a meeting that takes place in March.

Marika Konings:I think Curative Rights will have its Initial Report out for public

comment?

Marika Konings:@Keith - the meetings team wants to review during the next meeting scheduled for 4 January (probably in response to ensuring that the HIT topics would be known well in advance of the schedule development?)

Philip Corwin:CRP WG will be publishing its preliminary report for public comment early in January

Mary Wong:And if we meet that deadline, public comments will close in late Feb, so Copenhagen will see the WG in review mode and prepping final recs.

Philip Corwin:So comment period will close mid-February. Whether we have final report ready for Copenhagen depends on number and content of comments

Philip Corwin:Agree with Mary's assessment

Rubens Kuhl (RySG):SubPro WG will likely have CC2 ready by then.

Amr Elsadr:@Glen: NOOOOOO!!! :(

Keith Drazek:THANK YOU, GLEN, FOR ALL YOUR SERVICE AND GOOD CHEER!!!!

Stephanie Perrin:Glen we will miss you so much!!

David Olive:We will miss you Glen. You have been great for my fruitful years

James Bladel:Thank you, Glen. Not a dry eye in the hosue.

Susan Kawaguchi:We cant do this without you Glen!!!!

Paul McGrady -IPC:Glen - you will be missed so much!!!

Stefania Milan:thank you Glen! We will miss you very much

Darcy Southwell:Glen, you are so wonderful. We will miss you so very much!!

Julf Helsingius:We will reaally, really miss you! GNSO won't be the same!

Donna Austin, RySG:Dearest Glen, you are much loved and we are so blessed to have had your support over the many years.

Philip Corwin:Glen, you have always done a superb job and will be missed hugely. May all your post-ICANN activities be fulfilling.

Heather Forrest:Glen = GNSO

Keith Drazek:DNSO!

Stefania Milan:thhnks Glen for sharing this sad news with us in person, rather than in writing.

Valerie Tan:Thank you Glen for your dedication, you will be missed!

Paul McGrady -IPC:Glen you are the most elegant person I have ever met. Thank you for your example.

Amr Elsadr:@Glen: Only love and gratitude to you. You will be missed so much.

Rubens Kuhl (RySG):Miss you already, Glen. Good luck.

James Bladel:No. Not "goodbye".

Susan Kawaguchi:+1 to James

Philip Corwin:Not goodbye, but until we meet again

Julf Helsingius:Definitely not goodbye!

James Bladel:We'll still see you on the list and in Copenhangen. ANd if I'm lucky, our paths will continue to cross again.

Julf Helsingius:+1

Keith Drazek:+1 Rafik

Stephanie Perrin:Well said Rafik!

Donna Austin, RySG:Well said Rafik

Susan Kawaguchi:+1

Darcy Southwell:Perfect words, Rafik!

Keith Drazek:Thanks all, thanks for running today's meeting Heather

Wolf-Ulrich Knoblen:Glen, thank you for all you've done for us!

Paul McGrady -IPC:Heather did great!

Glen de Saint Gery:Thank you all so much - thank you all for the wonderful words and sentiments!

James Bladel:Thanks, Heather! Happy holidays everyone. And stay safe if you're traveling...

Glen de Saint Gery:Happy Holidays Everyone and until Copenhagen

Michele Neylon:well if you want to give us January and February off I won't complain :)

James Bladel:Thanks all.

Stephanie Perrin:We look forward to celebrating with you there Glen

Philip Corwin:happy holidays and a great new year to all!

Stefania Milan:Bye!

Amr Elsadr:Thanks all. Bye and happy holidays.

Susan Kawaguchi:thanks all

Stefania Milan:happy holidays

Rubens Kuhl (RySG):Happy Holidays!

Darcy Southwell:Thanks. Bye and happy holidays to all.

Valerie Tan:Happy holidays everyone!

Julf Helsingius:happy holidays!