

**GNSO  
Rights Protection Mechanisms (RPM) working group teleconference  
25 September 2007**

**Note:** The following is the output of transcribing from an audio recording of the RPM wg teleconference on 25 September 2007. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases it is incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages or transcription errors. It is posted as an aid to understanding the proceedings at the meeting, but should not be treated as an authoritative record. The audio is also available at:

<http://audio.icann.org/gnso/gnso-rpm-ad-hoc-20070925.mp3>

<http://gnso.icann.org/calendar/#sep>

**Present on the call**

Mike Rodenbaugh - CBUC - GNSO Council

Kristina Rosette - IPC - GNSO Council

Greg Shatan - IPC

Margie Milam - Registrar/IPC

Kelly Smith - IPC

Mike Palage - IPC

J.Scott Evans - IPC

**ICANN Staff**

Olof Nordling - Manager, Policy Development Coordination

Glen de Saint Géry - GNSO Secretariat

**Absent Apologies:**

Tim Ruiz - Registrar

Glen de Saint Géry: J. Scott Evans, Margie Milam, Mike Palage, Greg Shatan, Kristina Rosette.

Mike Rodenbaugh: And Mike Rodenbaugh.

Glen de Saint Géry: And Mike Rode -- oh sorry, Mike. It's you right up on the top of my list.

Mike Palage: And what constituency might you be representing?

J. Scott Evans: Ouch. Ouch.

Greg Shatan: The entrepreneur constituency.

Man 1: There you go. Hey I'm all for that. I'm defending Mike on the BC list.

J. Scott Evans: Kelly has sent around a first draft. And I think I need to work through this in the next week to look at what she's done. Has anybody had a chance to read what she's done?

Kristina Rosette: I have to confess that I have not.

J. Scott Evans: Basically it's just sort of a summary of what a Sunrise process is. I think what we really need to do is we need to do an appendix or something -- that sort of talks about what the Sunrise processes have been for the different type.

Kristina Rosette: We have this.

J. Scott Evans: We do?

Kristina Rosette: Yes.

J. Scott Evans: Already ready?

Kristina Rosette: They were -- well as part of the pro working group, we divvied up all of the TLDs -- and we threw in .eu for the sake of completeness.

J. Scott Evans: Okay.

Kristina Rosette: And we did summaries of those. So...

Kelly Smith: Hi. It's Kelly Smith joining.

Kristina Rosette: ...those charts are available somewhere.

J. Scott Evans: Okay. We just need (unintelligible - talkover)

Man 2: Excuse me. Olof Nordling now joined.

Olof Nordling: Hello. This is Olof.

J. Scott Evans: I think (unintelligible - talkover).

Olof Nordling: New kid on the block.

J. Scott Evans: We should find those and circulate those. I guess we could ask (Liz) if she...

Kristina Rosette: All right. Glen, could you -- would it be possible for you or Olof to send around -- or maybe just post -- well I don't know if you can post it to the list. It might be too long -- send around a copy of the final report of the pro working group?

Glen de Saint Géry: I'll do that with pleasure.

Kristina Rosette: That would be great.

Glen de Saint Géry: It's in a URL. So that's all right.

Kristina Rosette: Oh perfect. Thank you.

J. Scott Evans: That's great.

Glen de Saint Géry: It's a copy of the pro working group. What else would you like?

Because (Liz) isn't for -- sorry. J. Scott might not be aware. But (Liz) is no longer with us.

J. Scott Evans: Oh?

Glen de Saint Géry: Yes. Olof is now staff person on the call.

Mike Palage: (Liz) has joined the entrepreneurial constituency as well.

J. Scott Evans: I see. So I think that that's what we should do -- is first off is look at that. And I need to look at that. Kelly -- you've done a nice job. And I apologize. I hope you saw my e-mail. With everything that's been going on in my life, I never responded...

Kelly Smith: I did. And I was sorry to hear about that. But I'm excited you're coming to California.

J. Scott Evans: I am. So I think that what we should do is get that circulated, Glen.

Glen de Saint Géry: Okay.

J. Scott Evans: And then let's try to have a call -- after people review this section 4 that has been done by -- now all this stuff about terms of reference and

stuff that's in this form -- I don't think we have any terms of reference for this group, do we? Or...

Kelly Smith: Yes. Yes.

J. Scott Evans: We do have objectives. We know what those are. And we can put in an introduction. But the terms of reference section can be removed. And then recommendations is going to be an important section.

But we sort of need to look at this pro group -- when we look at the other Sunrise period -- what I thought about doing is sort of putting that in as an appendix. And then taking from there what an objective is -- and our recommendations in my point of view would be try to pick out the strengths.

And that's what we'll need to come up to a consensus -- a strength of some of the different ones -- models have been used -- and make some recommendations there. Do other people agree or disagree?

Mike Palage: This is Palage -- just a comment. Since we don't have terms of reference, my understanding when we -- after San Juan -- was this group was supposed to sort of if you will -- provide a if you will -- a fact sheet as to -- these are the different types of mechanisms that have been used. Please feel free to choose from it.

Now if we begin to make recommendations -- I think we potentially exceed what our mandate was. Because when we begin to make recommendations, we're going to be saying, "This we think is better than this" or "This is better than that."

I think we sort of cross over that -- sort of the consumer -- what is it -- you know how you go to Consumer Report magazine? You're looking at the cars -- what are their pros? What are the minuses? It's okay if you want to sit there and say, "These are the strengths. These are the weaknesses."

But when you begin to make recommendations and say, "You should choose the Honda over the Toyota," I think that potentially gets us into a problematic situation. Because there were a lot of people -- as Kristine (sic) could articulate...

Kristina Rosette: Kristina.

Mike Palage: ...during the pro group -- that was very passionate over making specific recommendations.

J. Scott Evans: But then why don't we just change five from recommendations to considerations? And then we can just put some overall broad considerations they need to consider?

Kristina Rosette: I think that's a great idea. Because then that allows us to capture -- to the extent we will have them -- technical input from the registries that have actually implemented these before.

J. Scott Evans: Yes. That's what I would say. Because what we're sort of doing is putting together a list -- for me as a new applicant -- come in and I can sort of look at a menu -- and decide if I want to choose one of these or design my own. And I think then at the end -- rather than making recommendations make it considerations -- and sort of try to pull out

some broad-based points that sort of apply the implementation of these.

Mike Palage: And put it this way -- I think that approach -- as both you and Kristine (sic) have articulated -- will be very beneficial in this being well received as opposed to it being -- if you will -- I think we're going to prevent push back.

J. Scott Evans: Okay.

Mike Palage: So we'll actually create a useful document that will have use -- instead of being contested.

J. Scott Evans: Well why don't we do this. Can we agree to meet next week some time? And I will try to put the -- if you will find that pro stuff, I will try to dump that into this.

Glen de Saint Géry: It's just gone over to everybody on the list.

J. Scott Evans: Okay. And I will try to incorporate that in here -- and maybe write us a brief introduction -- and sort of get this into a more draft form by next week. That okay with everybody? (Unintelligible - talkover)

Mike Palage: What I could do, J. Scott -- and again, I am really tight with time -- but what I can do is someone who -- if you will -- over designed and implemented the Afiliias mobi and now the .Asia Sunrise. I could help review it. I'm just being honest. I don't have the bandwidth or the resources...

J. Scott Evans: That's fine. Don't worry about that. But if we could do this -- everyone look at your calendars now. Let's make a time to do a call next week. And what we'll agree on is -- I will have us something to look at that we can start putting more meat on the bone. So I will at least get us more bones right now.

Mike Rodenbaugh: We already have a call scheduled for a week from now.

Glen de Saint Géry: There is one. Yes.

Mike Palage: Okay. When on...

Glen de Saint Géry: On Tuesday at...

Mike Palage: The 2nd?

Glen de Saint Géry: ...the same time. Yes.

Mike Palage: Okay.

Kristina Rosette: And just I want to let everyone know -- I'm not going to be able to make that. I'm going to be in Cincinnati.

J. Scott Evans: Well Kristina, if I do this -- if I can commit to get something to you this weekend just to look at -- could you send me your comments?

Kristina Rosette: Oh absolutely.

J. Scott Evans: And then we'll at least have your input.

Kristina Rosette: Sure.

J. Scott Evans: Is that okay with everybody?

Kristina Rosette: Yes. Oh and J. Scott -- if as you're working with the pros desk -- you need to have the underlying Word document...

J. Scott Evans: Okay.

Kristina Rosette: ...let me know. And I'll...

J. Scott Evans: Okay.

Kristina Rosette: They're in our document management system somewhere.

J. Scott Evans: Okay. Is that okay everybody? That at least gives us a goal for next week. And I'll promise not to disappear this time. My insurance carrier is handling the house. And we're back in our offices. So we should be okay.

Mike Rodenbaugh: But the goal next week is to basically have read Kelly's document and...

J. Scott Evans: That's right -- and to look over that pro document -- to look over the sections that Margie's referred to. So if you have any problems -- because what I really plan to do is just dump some of that right in here -- with minimal editing. Don't you think that would be the most efficient, Margie? You're sort of familiar with it. Do you think that's the most efficient use of that?

Kristina Rosette: J. Scott, are you talking to me?

Margie Milam: I think it was Kristina that was commenting. But yes. I do agree.

J. Scott Evans: Well you were the one, Margie, that -- well we've already put this together.

Margie Milam: Yes. That's right. We have put it together.

J. Scott Evans: And since that's already gotten some sort of consensus, correct -- or either it wouldn't be in the report. It seems to be less controversial if we just -- and we can acknowledge that we've adopted this from that -- just so we're totally forthcoming -- to say we've used this and blah blah blah.

But I think it's the best to do. Let's not duplicate efforts or state something that brings up an issue -- that has to be all re-argued again - - when it's already been hashed out in another group.

Margie Milam: I agree it's good. That's got more details than I put in my few paragraphs, J. Scott -- cost and timing.

J. Scott Evans: Okay. Well we will look at that. And I will try to have something circulated -- if not before -- by Monday morning East Coast time. And that will give everybody about a little over 24 hours to look at it. And if you'll already have reviewed Kelly's stuff -- and you'll already have reviewed this pro stuff with regards to the mechanisms -- there won't be that much new stuff to look at -- except for maybe the introductions and fine tuning things.

Kelly Smith: Well and in fact you've got most of the people on this call actually did the pro stuff.

J. Scott Evans: Okay. All right. Well...

Kelly Smith: We have (unintelligible - talkover)

J. Scott Evans: So you actually don't need to do any -- I'm going to need to familiarize myself more than anyone. But that's okay.

Kelly Smith: Right.

J. Scott Evans: All right? Does that look okay? Olof, is that okay with you?

Olof Nordling: Hey. New kid on the block -- everything to learn here.

J. Scott Evans: Okay. Well I think that that sounds like a plan for now. And if during any of this you all want to send me an e-mail -- about thoughts you have -- feel free to do so.

Kelly Smith: Were we also are going to have sections on other write-protection mechanisms?

J. Scott Evans: We...

Kelly Smith: Or is it all going to be Sunrise?

J. Scott Evans: I think we can. But let's get through the Sunrise section first.

Kelly Smith: All right.

J. Scott Evans: And tackle it. And then we can talk about it. But I think yes -- we need to do that as well.

Kelly Smith: Well is Jeff on the call?

J. Scott Evans: No. (unintelligible)

Mike Rodenbaugh: I'd love if every - if people could take a look at the fishing plan that I stepped around...

J. Scott Evans: Okay.

Mike Rodenbaugh: ...comments in the next week. So that'd be super, too. Because we really are trying to finalize that for .Asia.

J. Scott Evans: Okay. And that came out yesterday, right? You sent it around yesterday?

Mike Rodenbaugh: Yes. It's been a work in progress for a while. Some folks have seen rather earlier drafts.

J. Scott Evans: Okay.

Mike Rodenbaugh: (Unintelligible) will go probably maybe two or three months to go now. But now it's shooting to very close to final form.

J. Scott Evans: Okay. Any other comments? All right then. It seems like to oar is for me to pick up and get something out. I'll look at the fishing thing, Mike -

- and I will get a draft around by first thing Monday morning if not before -- for everyone to look at. And then we can start doing this.

In the meantime -- everyone think about these other rights protection mechanism things -- and sort of give me an idea of what else besides Sunrise -- because right now my mind's sort of in a fog. I know they're out there.

Kelly Smith: We had teams set up for the other ones.

J. Scott Evans: Yes. I think they've sort of fallen off the...

Kelly Smith: Right. Well...

Mike Rodenbaugh: So we actually agree that everyone -- we're going to go around again on this call I think -- and figure out what everybody was doing.

J. Scott Evans: Well Kelly and I were doing Sunrise.

Kelly Smith: Right. And I had agreed to send Jeff Neuman a list of all the things I would've done differently with IT claim. And since he basically designed it -- and wrote the approval contact report -- he was planning to just pull something together based on all my stuff.

J. Scott Evans: And wasn't he also going to get together with some people not on this group -- but about technical considerations?

Mike Rodenbaugh: Say that one more time -- sorry, J. Scott.

J. Scott Evans: Jeff had agreed to get together with some other of the registry people -  
- and talk about technical considerations for write protection  
mechanisms -- that needed to be considered.

Mike Rodenbaugh: Think that was maybe the second step after we came up with...

J. Scott Evans: Okay.

Mike Rodenbaugh: ...the Sunrise plans.

J. Scott Evans: Okay.

Mike Rodenbaugh: ...(unintelligible) back inside -- but what that meant from  
implementation...

J. Scott Evans: Okay. All right.

Mike Rodenbaugh: There was another -- I guess certainly I agreed to do more than just  
a fishing plan -- also something around the DDR (unintelligible) on  
rapid take down proposal. I'm working on (unintelligible). And then  
Peter Olson had some other good ideas in the RPM group -- that I  
thought were worth exploring -- and potentially bring into this document  
as well.

J. Scott Evans: Okay. Well then I think you've just volunteered...

Mike Rodenbaugh: Yes.

J. Scott Evans: To let us know what things are in the next call.

Mike Rodenbaugh: No problem.

Kelly Smith: Actually they're all in the pro working group report.

Mike Rodenbaugh: Yes.

Kristina Rosette: Right. So the Appendix.

Mike Rodenbaugh: Yes.

J. Scott Evans: I started looking at that. And I got to tell you I sort of grayed out at a point. And I need to be more focused. I apologize. That was a lazy reader in me. I need to get more familiar with that. I apologize to everyone.

Woman: All right.

J. Scott Evans: But we've got -- at least we're back on track. We've got to -- listen. I've put stuff together faster than we -- we've got plenty of time. We've got three weeks to get something. If we just -- if I could get us something to get us jumping off -- then it's all going to fall into place.

Woman: All right.

J. Scott Evans: Now everybody here's bright. We've all dealt with these issues so many, many times. It's just sort of coalescing it all -- and then putting a little shine on it. And I think we can do that. So look forward to seeing everybody - speaking with everybody at 11:00 am Eastern next Tuesday which is -- is that 1500 UTC?

Glen de Saint G ry: That's right. Yes.

J. Scott Evans: Yes. Okay.

Mike Rodenbaugh: Also at the outset of the call, Glen was suggesting about a meeting time in Los Angeles.

Glen de Saint G ry: Yes.

Mike Rodenbaugh: There was only a couple of us on the call at that time. We thought that was a great idea.

J. Scott Evans: I think so, too.

Mike Rodenbaugh: Does everybody else agree with that -- to try to set a meeting in L.A.? Will everybody be attending in L.A.?

Kelly Smith: I won't be.

Greg Shatan: This is Greg Shatan. I probably will not be either.

Kristina Rosette: I will.

Greg Shatan: But we can always do a dial-in.

J. Scott Evans: That's right. We can always do a dial-in -- as long as Glen -- if you will just look at the schedule and see when there's a possible time.

Glen de Saint G ry: Would the Thursday or the second day be better for you -- that's a Sunday - that's a Saturday -- or the Sunday just before the official

meetings? If you just give me a chance - an idea then I can put that -- I can put some space in the two hours. Would that be enough?

J. Scott Evans: Yes. I think so. Two hours, Mike?

Mike Rodenbaugh: I think that's plenty.

J. Scott Evans: You want to do it on Sunday?

Mike Rodenbaugh: Is there time on Sunday -- with all the GNSO meetings going?

Glen de Saint Géry: (Unintelligible - talkover)

J. Scott Evans: And the GNSO -- what is it -- there's GNSO meetings scheduled for both Saturday...

Glen de Saint Géry: Saturday and Sunday. Yes.

J. Scott Evans: ...and Sunday.

Glen de Saint Géry: The problem is will you be - will you all be there on Sunday? Will you all have arrived?

Kristina Rosette: I would prefer -- I can do Saturday. But if we're going to do Saturday, I would prefer that we do it later in the day...

Glen de Saint Géry: Okay.

Kristina Rosette: ...towards afternoon time.

Glen de Saint Géry: Okay.

Kristina Rosette: I don't know how that works for everybody -- because then nobody needs to fly in the day before.

Greg Shatan: And that's better for me in New York. I'd rather do it in the evening than during the day when I have soccer coaching.

Kristina Rosette: Sure.

J. Scott Evans: I will be there depending on when the meeting is.

Glen de Saint Géry: Okay.

J. Scott Evans: So you just need to get it scheduled. Tell me where it's going to be. And I'll make sure that I'm there to be at the meeting.

Glen de Saint Géry: Okay.

J. Scott Evans: So late Saturday would be better -- because that means I could leave Saturday morning.

Glen de Saint Géry: Okay. Good.

J. Scott Evans: Saturday morning here, Kristina -- puts us there right after lunch?

Kristina Rosette: Yes. There's actually like an 8:30 flight out of Dulles that gets us in - gets in at like 11:00.

J. Scott Evans: Yes.

Kristina Rosette: That would work for me.

J. Scott Evans: So on Saturday late...

Glen de Saint Géry: There will be other -- sorry to interrupt -- but there will be other council meet - other council sessions on that Saturday.

Mike Palage: And I think, Glen -- according to the schedule -- I think that Whois one of the topics, is it?

Glen de Saint Géry: Yes. Whois and new GTLDs.

Mike Palage: And then on -- I thought new GTLDs was just -- is that on Saturday or Sunday? Or do they just double it up on both?

Glen de Saint Géry: I think it's still very much fluid.

Mike Palage: Okay.

Kristina Rosette: And in large part because we have to prepare for the big council...

Glen de Saint Géry: The workshop.

Kristina Rosette: ...workshop.

Glen de Saint Géry: Yes.

Mike Palage: Put it this way. I'm coaching -- much like Greg I coach my soccer team on Saturday morning -- and probably just going to be heading out

either Saturday night or first thing Sunday morning. So just let me know...

Glen de Saint Géry: Okay.

Mike Palage: ...and whether -- what day we're going to pick there so I could just plan my flights accordingly.

Glen de Saint Géry: Okay. Thanks.

Mike Rodenbaugh: And I'm just wondering if it might make more sense to try for Wednesday instead of on the weekends -- with all the council meetings.

Mike Palage: No. We want to get this stuff out of the way, Mike -- I think as soon as possible.

Kristina Rosette: Not to mention the fact that I for one am going to need a really strong drink after the council vote on Whois. (Unintelligible - talkover)

J. Scott Evans: All right. So I'm going to leave the scheduling to you. Just let me know when it is...

Glen de Saint Géry: Okay.

J. Scott Evans: ...and I'll be there. And the only is -- given that Greg and some of the others have said they might not be able to make it -- if we could have facilities for dial-in.

Glen de Saint Géry: Okay. My problem...

J. Scott Evans: Okay? Well thanks everybody. Glen, thank you again. If you'll send in dial-in information for next week's call -- and I will get everything out.

Glen de Saint Géry: I'll do that.

J. Scott Evans: All right.

Glen de Saint Géry: Thank you.

Mike Palage: Groovy.

Mike Rodenbaugh: J. Scott, good luck recovering from the flood.

J. Scott Evans: All right. Thanks.

Kristina Rosette: Now J. Scott -- are you physically in California now?

J. Scott Evans: No, not yet.

Kristina Rosette: Oh okay.

J. Scott Evans: I will not be physically in California -- well I will be physically in California a lot during the next 60 days. But for 60 days I'm still at my firm.

Kristina Rosette: Oh okay.

Mike Rodenbaugh: So you're starting at Yahoo around Thanksgiving?

J. Scott Evans: Yes.

Mike Rodenbaugh: Cool. Congratulations.

J. Scott Evans: It's going to be great I think. I'm really, really excited -- going to be new. Luckily I know where Mike lives -- so I can find out everything I need to know.

Mike Rodenbaugh: I remember when you were just interviewing for the job.

J. Scott Evans: All right. Take care everybody.

Mike Rodenbaugh: Let's do it. (Unintelligible)

J. Scott Evans: Bye.

Kristina Rosette: Bye.

Man: Bye.

Glen de Saint Géry: Bye. Thanks.

END