ccNSO Council Meeting Minutes Mexico City
4th March 2009

Attendees

Nashwa Abdelbaki
Bart Boswinkel
Becky Burr
Victor Ciza
Lesley Cowley
Chris Disspain
Keith Drazek
Ondrej Filip
Olivier Guillard *(telephone)*
Patrick Hosein
Hiro Hotta
Young-Eum Lee
Paulos Nyirenda *(telephone)*
Patricio Poblete
Oscar Robles
Gabriella Schittek
Dotty Sparks de Blanc
Jian Zhang

Apologies

Erick Iriarte
Oscar Moreno
Peter Van Roste

1) Confirmation of Approval of Minutes and Actions from Council Call 16th February 2009

No comments were noted.

2) Election of ccNSO Chair

The vice Chair informed those present that Chris Disspain's term as Chair now ended and asked those present to propose a Chair.

Ondrej Filip proposed to re-elect Chris Disspain for another term

Dotty Sparks de Blanc and *Nashwa Abdelbaki* seconded the proposal.

Resolution
38-01: IT WAS RESOLVED to reappoint Chris Disspain as the chair of the ccNSO Council for another 12 month term.

The resolution was passed unanimously.

3) Election of ccNSO Vice Chair

The Vice chair *Patricio Poblete* explained that due to other obligations it would not be possible for him to continue to commit to the role of vice chair. He therefore declared he would not to re-stand for the position.

The Chair suggested that there should be two vice-chairs in future in order to share the work load. The Councillors agreed.

The Chair nominated *Young-Eum Lee* for the first vice Chair position.

Patrick Hosein seconded the nomination.

Resolution
38-02: IT WAS RESOLVED to appoint Young-Eum Lee as one of two vice chairs of the ccNSO Council for a 12 month term commencing at the end of this meeting.

The resolution was passed unanimously.

The Chair nominated *Byron Holland* for the second vice Chair position.

Hiro Hotta seconded the nomination.

Resolution
38-03: IT WAS RESOLVED to appoint Byron Holland as one of two vice chairs of the ccNSO Council for a 12 month term commencing at the end of this meeting.

The resolution was passed unanimously.

4) GNSO Observer

The Chair informed the meeting that two applications for the GNSO Observer position were received. However, as the Council had no time to consider the applicants, a decision would be postponed until the next Council telephone conference.

5) Approval of Eric Akumiah as AfTLD's Observer to the Council

The Council received a nomination from AfTLD to accept their new General Manager, Eric Akumiah as the new AfTLD Observer to the Council.

The Council approved the nomination unanimously.

6) Approval of .ms membership application

The Chair presented a membership application from .ms (Montserrat) to the Council and informed the meeting that it meets all necessary requirements. The Council was asked to vote on the application.

The Council approved .ms's membership application unanimously.

7) ccNSO Participation Working Group:

7.1) Adoption of Participation Working Group Report
7.2) Closure of Participation Working Group

Lesley Cowley started by thanking Kieren McCarthy for arranging the remote participation facilities for the Mexico City meeting.

She then reminded the group that the final Working Group report was sent to the Council on the 26th February 2009, containing a series of recommendations which she hoped would be embedded in the ccNSO's ongoing work.
.
She therefore considered the working group's work completed and recommended its closure.

Young-Eum Lee said she would like to commend Lesley for a wonderful job.

The Chair asked the Council to adopt the Participation Working Group final report.

Lesley Cowley proposed the resolution, *Patricio Poblete* seconded it.

Resolution
38-04: IT WAS RESOLVED to adopt the Participation Working Group final report.

The resolution was passed unanimously.

The Chair then asked the Council to formally close the Participation Working Group and to thank its members for the extraordinary amount of work they did.

Ondrej Filip proposed the resolution, *Becky Burr* seconded it.

Resolution
38-05: IT WAS RESOLVED to close the Participation Working Group and to thank its members for their extraordinary work.

The resolution was passed unanimously.

8) Closure of ccNSO IANA Working Group

Olivier Guillard indicated that he had sent the ccNSO IANA Working Group report to the ccNSO IANA Working Group, and more recently to the Council during the foregoing week. The document reports about recent activity of the Working Group and ongoing IANA issues related to ccs. Considering the way IANA organises its work and communications for ccs, the report recommends the conclusion of the IANA Working Group.

Since no objections were received, Olivier proposed to formally close the IANA Working Group.

He also asked that the report should be published on the ccNSO website.

Action 38-01
The ccNSO Secretariat to publish the IANA Working Group report on the ccNSO website.

Lesley Cowley reminded the Council that she had raised concern during previous calls that a closure might mean that the ccNSO loses involvement with the IANA. She had therefore suggested that IANA issues should be carried on within the Technical Working Group and wanted to know what had happened to that suggestion.

Ondrej Filip supported this view, pointing out that there still is much work to be done on the automated IANA software.

The Chair replied that he is working on that issue and that the technical working group's scope and charter needs to be revisited and revamped in order to give it authority to be dealing with IANA. He thought that the best way to deal with the issue would be to accept Olivier's recommendation and to note that the IANA relationship continuation issue should be dealt with during the next Council call.

He then suggested that the Council resolves to accept the ccNSO IANA Working Group Report.

Olivier Guillard proposed the resolution, *Lesley Cowley* seconded it.

Resolution
38-06: IT WAS RESOLVED to approve the ccNSO IANA Working Group Report.

The resolution was passed unanimously.

The Chair then suggested that the ccNSO IANA Working Group is closed in accordance with the recommendations of the ccNSO IANA Working Group report.

Olivier Guillard proposed the resolution; *Dotty Sparks de Blanc* seconded it.

Resolution
38-07: IT WAS RESOLVED to close the ccNSO IANA Working Group in accordance with the recommendations of the ccNSO IANA Working Group report.

The resolution was passed unanimously.

The Chair presented a third resolution, on reviewing the scope of the Technical Working Group to ensure that it is mandated and capable of undertaking continuing work with IANA on outstanding issues.

The resolution was proposed by *Ondrej Filip* and seconded by *Lesley Cowley*.

Resolution
38-08: IT WAS RESOLVED to review the scope of the Technical Working Group to ensure that it is mandated and capable of undertaking continuing work with IANA on outstanding issues.

The resolution was passed unanimously.

(The telephone participants were dropped off the line and not able to vote on the resolution)

The Chair proposed to pass a fourth resolution where the Council formally thanks Olivier Guillard for the extraordinary amount of work that he has done over the years in respect to leading the ccNSO IANA Working Group.

Becky Burr proposed the resolution and Oscar Robles seconded it.

Resolution
38-09: IT WAS RESOLVED to thank Olivier Guillard for his extraordinary amount of work he has done over the years in leading the ccNSO IANA Working Group.

The resolution was passed unanimously.

(The telephone participants were dropped off the line and not able to vote on the resolution)

9) Approval of SOP Charter

The Chair asked for comments on the Strategic and Operational Planning Working Group (SOP) Charter.

Hiro Hotta pointed out that under section 4 "Duration", the first sentence says the Working Group term is one year. However, he thought that it should say that the term of the Working Group members is one year.

After some discussions, the Council agreed adding the word "member" after the first "working group" mentioned, so that it reads "The term of a Working Group member is one year".

Lesley Cowley proposed the resolution and *Hiro Hotta* seconded it.

Resolution
38-10: IT WAS RESOLVED to adopt the SOP Working Group Charter, subject to amendment so that it reads "the term of a working group member is one year".

The resolution was passed unanimously.

(The telephone participants were dropped off the line and not able to vote on the resolution)

10) IDNs:

10.1) Setup of email list to update on IDN related issues

The Chair introduced the topic and said it was a result of the discussions that were held during the Council workshop a few days earlier, where it was suggested to set up an email list for members and Councillors specifically devoted to IDN issues. The

subscribers were to receive a biweekly update on IDN issues from the ccNSO, GNSO and GAC space.

Bart Boswinkel suggested that instead of creating another email list, the ccNSO Website should be used for this. A message board should be created where interested parties can look for news.

Young-Eum Lee agreed on the suggestion, but added that the creation of the website should be widely notified. Also, she suggested that if certain important issues would come up, these issues should also be conveyed on the email lists.

Action 38-02
The ccNSO Secretariat to create a message board on the ccNSO website, dedicated to IDN issues.

10.2) Resolution on IDN Fast-track

The Chair informed the Council that the proposed IDN resolution on the fast-track was discussed in the members meeting and was posted to the email list and no comments or objections were received. He therefore asked the Council to vote on the proposed resolution.

Young-Eum Lee proposed the resolution, *Patrick Hosein* seconded it.

Resolution
38-11: IT WAS RESOLVED that**:** IDN ccTLDs should be treated similarly to ASCII ccTLDs and so:

1) On the Relationship between ICANN and IDN ccTLD Managers

1.1 The entering into of a documented relationship between ICANN and an IDN ccTLD manager should be voluntary and not a requirement for the delegation of the IDN ccTLD.
1.2 Such a documented relationship should be encouraged
1.3 It is in the best interest of IDN ccTLDs managers and the entire DNS community to adhere to all relevant IETF standards (including the IDNA protocol) and the IDN Guidelines and to commit to complying with future IDNA protocol updates.

2) On Financial Contributions to ICANN

2.1 Financial contributions should be voluntary and should not be a requirement for the delegation of an IDN ccTLD.
2.2 As previously stated by ccTLD managers, detailed information from ICANN on the breakdown of the costs involved in the IDN ccTLD Fast Track programme (and other costs ICANN incurs related to ccTLDs) would be welcome and help advance discussions.
2.3 Concrete proposals on possible financial contribution models would also help to advance discussions.
2.4 The Council acknowledges and appreciates that work on the information outlined in 2.2 and 2.3. has commenced and looks forward to receiving it as soon as possible.

The resolution was passed unanimously.

(The telephone participants were dropped off the line and not able to vote on the resolution)

The Chair said that he would read out the resolution during the next day's Supporting Organisation reports.

10.3) Discussion on Issues Report

The Chair asked the group whether there were any discussions on the IDN issues report. He clarified that the report was sent to the Council for their initial comments, to see if they are happy with the approach and to give the chance to make some minor non-substantive changes. After receiving the Council's input, it will then be published for public comments.

No discussions were initiated by the Councillors.

11) ccNSO Council Workshop Outcome:

11.1) ccNSO Planning Agenda

The Chair noted that one output from the ccNSO Council Workshop is the ccNSO Work Plan. This will be sent out to the Council for a check-through and will then be published on the website.

Action 38-03
The ccNSO Secretariat to publish the ccNSO Council Workshop Planning Agenda and publish it on the ccNSO website.

11.2) Setup of Programme Working Group for the Management of ccNSO Member Meeting Agenda

The Chair reminded the group that another outcome of the Council Workshop was the set up of a Programme Working Group, which is to manage the ccNSO member meetings agendas. A resolution for setting up such a Working Group would need to be passed.

The resolution was proposed by *Ondrej Filip* and seconded by *Nashwa Abdelbaki*.

Resolution
38-12: IT WAS RESOLVED to set up a Programme Working Group for the management of ccNSO member meeting agendas.

The resolution was passed unanimously.

Action 38-04
The ccNSO Secretariat to make a call for participants in the Programme Working Group.

11.3) Setup of Delegation and Re-delegation Working Group

The Chair said that another outcome of the Council Workshop was the set up of a Delegation and Re-delegation Working Group.

He explained that this idea derived from discussions held during the workshop where it was felt that the time had come for the ccNSO to start addressing the issue. He underlined that at this stage the issue was eclipsed by the work that needs to be done in respect to IDNs, however it was felt that a group could be formed which could undertake some preparatory work on that topic. A resolution would need to be passed to formalise the Working Group.

The Chair further said that the ccNSO Secretariat would be asked to draft a first outline charter, which is to be approved by the Council during a telephone conference. Once the draft outline charter has been approved, a call for members will be done.

The resolution was proposed by *Keith Drazek* and seconded by *Patrick Hosein.*

Resolution
38-13: IT WAS RESOLVED to set up a Delegation and Re-delegation Working Group.

The resolution was passed unanimously.

Action 38-05
The ccNSO Secretariat to draft an outline charter for the Delegation and Re-delegation Working Group.

12) Discussion on ACSO session

The Chair asked the Council members on their feelings of the joint Advisory Committee/Supporting Organisation (ACSO) sessions and whether they felt that a resolution should be passed to support the continuation of these sessions.

Becky Burr said she thought the sessions are valuable and that the format they were held in during the Mexico meeting was more interactive and interesting for those present. However, she pointed out that there is some general concern that the sessions take away some time from the interaction with the ICANN board, so she was looking for a way to balance these issues.

The Chair replied that the sessions might be shortened from three hour sessions to two, in order to improve the balance.

Oscar Robles wondered if it perhaps would be an idea to include Board members in the ACSO sessions.

Lesley Cowley said that the format of the last session was much better than the previous ones used. She also said it would be interesting to see a summary of the feedback comments and thought that coming sessions should be built and taken forward based on them.

The Chair said he realised that a resolution on the subject would need to be drafted carefully, so he suggested postponing it to the next telephone conference and said that it then perhaps could be sent to the Board.

13) Thanks

13.1 Mexico Meetings Organisers

The Chair extended his thanks to the Mexico meetings organisers, who worked extremely hard to make the meeting possible.

The thanks were expressed by acclamation.

13.2 Kieren McCarthy

The Chair said he would like to have a formal resolution to thank *Kieren McCarthy* for making remote participation possible by using new software which is allowing people to watch, listen to and read what is going on in the meeting. It should also be mentioned that this should be carried through, if possible, in all future meetings and in all meeting rooms.

The resolution was proposed by *Lesley Cowley* and seconded by *Young-Eum Lee*.

Resolution
38-14 IT WAS RESOLVED to thank Kieren McCarthy for making remote audio-, video- and chat room participation possible. The Council hopes that this format will be available at all future ICANN meetings, in all meeting rooms.

The resolution was passed unanimously.

(The telephone participants were dropped off the line and not able to vote on the resolution)

Action 38-06
The ccNSO Secretariat to forward the resolution to Kieren McCarthy.

13.3 Erick Iriarte and LACTLD

The Chair asked the Council to thank *Erick Iriarte Ahon* and LACTLD for organising the ccNSO members dinner.

The thanks were expressed by acclamation.

13.4 Don Hollander

The Chair asked the Council to thank *Don Hollander*, until recently the APTLD manager, for his hard work and committment, not just in respect to APTLD, but also in respect to ccNSO activities in ICANN.

The thanks were expressed by acclamation.

13.5 Departing ccNSO Councillors

The Chair reminded the Council that three Councillors would be leaving by the end of the Council meeting.

The Chair asked the Council to thank *Victor Ciza* for his work on the Council, representing the African region.

The thanks were expressed by acclamation.

The Chair asked the Council to thank *Keith Drazek* for serving on the Council, bringing in a very interesting perspective working for a gTLD registry that manages a ccTLD.

The thanks were expressed by acclamation.

The Chair asked the Council to thank *Olivier Guillard* who has brought his unique perspective to many council matters during the past years.

The thanks were expressed by acclamation.

13.6 Demi Getschko

The Chair noted that *Demi Getschko* has been one of the ccNSO appointees to the ICAN Board for over three years, but decided not to re-stand for a further term. Whilst he regretted to see Demi leaving the Board, he welcomed him back into the ccNSO community.

He suggested that the ccNSO Council thanks Demi for the hard work and effort he has put in being an ICANN board member.

The thanks were expressed by acclamation.

13.7 ccNSO Secretariat

The Chair suggested thanking *Bart Boswinkel* and *Gabriella Schittek* for their efforts in supporting the meetings as well as their intersessional work.

The thanks were expressed by acclamation.

13.8 Scribes

The Chair suggested thanking the scribes for their extraordinary work.

The thanks were expressed by acclamation.

13.9 Welcome to New Council Members

The Chair welcomed the new Council members *Byron Holland*, *Juhani Juselius* and *Vika Mpisane* and thanked them for being prepared to serve on the ccNSO Council.

14) AOB

The Chair informed that the current membership of the ccNSO is responsible for about 84% of all registrations in the world and concluded that from a representation point of view it is a fairly good result, even if the ccNSO does not yet have 50% of all ccTLDs as members.
The meeting then closed.