

**GNSO  
Rights Protection Mechanisms (RPM) working group teleconference  
9 October 2007**

**Note:** The following is the output of transcribing from an audio recording of the RPM wg teleconference on 9 October 2007. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases it is incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages or transcription errors. It is posted as an aid to understanding the proceedings at the meeting, but should not be treated as an authoritative record. The audio is also available at:

<http://audio.icann.org/gnso/gnso-rpm-wg-20071009.mp3>

<http://gnso.icann.org/calendar/#oct>

**Present on the call**

Kristina Rosette - IPC - GNSO Council

Kelly Smith - IPC

J.Scott Evans - IPC

**ICANN Staff**

Olof Nordling - Manager, Policy Development Coordination

Glen de Saint Géry - GNSO Secretariat

Coordinator: Please go ahead.

(J.Scott Evans): So what - as I was saying before the recording started, what I tried to do in the draft that I have ineptly circulated to some of members of the - this working group, is to take and in the textual part of it, just highlight common features that are found in certain types of mechanisms.

And then let the charts - refer to the charts that show how those were implemented in certain other TLDs that have been prior abusive in the system. And then in our consideration section I thought we would just raise concerns that you might need to consider -- and we're not going to be able to get to the technical point, maybe that's what (Jeff) can bring

to the table with regards to certain considerations they may want to consider.

Yes, because it's really just sort of a - supposed to be a catalog, right?

Woman: Yes.

J. Scott Evans: For people can thumb through and say, "Well I like this mechanism, we're going to use this as our jumping off point or we're going to adopt this model." Right?

Woman: Mm-hm.

J. Scott Evans: And so that's what I'm trying - that's what I was trying to do. And I - it was (Kelly) that sort of got me started on that idea.

Woman: No I mean I think that's a great idea. And I - so to the extent that people had quote unquote criticisms for mechanisms, would that go in the consideration section?

J. Scott Evans: You know we could or we might just put - we may want to go in and take - and when I do the - we may want to do that in the text that talks about features.

Woman: Mm-hm.

J. Scott Evans: And we can say, you know, common complaints or, you know...

Woman: Yes, I tried to be - use kind of soft language, because I knew we wanted to stay away from (mecommondations).

J. Scott Evans: Right.

Woman: But I think in some cases I had laid option and said this one might be problematic.

J. Scott Evans: Right.

Woman: Because of blah, blah, blah.

Woman: Right.

J. Scott Evans: But we can look at how we want to word it once we get - what I'm trying to do is just get us something that we can start arguing about, you know, a rough draft.

Okay I'm sending this now.

Glen Desaintgery: (Unintelligible) are you (unintelligible). Could we just do a quick roll call with people on the call please? That's for the recording.

We've got J. Scott Evans, (Kristina Rosette) and (Kelly Smith). Has anybody else joined? And (Olaff Nordling) and myself, Glen. Okay thanks, sorry for the interruption.

J. Scott Evans: I just sent that posting again, so let's see if it hits the list. I sent that to [gns0-rpm-wg@icann.org](mailto:gns0-rpm-wg@icann.org).

J. Scott Evans: That's correct.

Glen Desaintgery: That's correct.

J. Scott Evans: So hopefully it will get there this time. So Christine if you get it, if you would just sort of look over, it's not long, because it's still really rough.

Woman: Mm-hm.

J. Scott Evans: And just let me know if you think we're headed down the - that's what I wanted from today is, are we headed down the right track.

Woman: Oh sure.

J. Scott Evans: Because I don't want to put a substantial amount of time in summarizing the rest of these if people are disagreeing.

Woman: Yes it haven't popped up yet.

J. Scott Evans: Okay, well it's been sent, so it's just entitled draft.

Woman: Okay.

J. Scott Evans: So, but I think until we get some input, I mean I hear what (Kelly's) saying that she didn't think it was horrifyingly offensive. That what we need from Olof—Olof can you clarify for us, sometime this week, the timeline?

(Olof): Yes I'm trying to do so, but I need to know what the baseline really looks like from the accounting perspective. So (I've sent off) - made to (Craig Austin) and for the same to confirm when. And (stating) as it doesn't appear that it would be needed within another month from now.

But he may be - might - I may have misinterpreted the timeline schedule.

J. Scott Evans: Okay.

(Olof): So I'll get back to you on that.

J. Scott Evans: All right.

Woman: Well and the other thing that I was mentioning, telling (Scott) before you joined was that I was trying to get some clarification as to the meeting that's tentatively scheduled for Saturday in LA.

(Unintelligible) just sent this, I just wasn't clear as whether that was suppose to be a meeting with this group, was it that it was suppose to be a session in which, you know, whatever work product coming out of this group, was, you know, made available to the council for discussion or what it was and...

J. Scott Evans: When is that meeting scheduled?

Woman: Saturday morning.

J. Scott Evans: I'm not getting in until Saturday afternoon.

Glen Desaintgery: We actually said we would set that for Saturday afternoon, didn't we, because it was too small people.

Woman: Right, right.

J. Scott Evans: Right.

Glen Desaintgery: Okay.

J. Scott Evans: Because I get in at 1:30.

Woman: Okay.

J. Scott Evans: We're very close to the airport, I think, so I'm sure I can make anything from 2:30 on, provided I don't have any delays. I think it should be this group at this point (Christina).

Kristina Rosette Well I don't necessarily disagree with you, but I think it might be a conversation we might want to have offline. Only because I know for example, you know, and I guess one of the things that I think really will determine whether where we can - whether or not we can just go that direction is, that I know originally some had decided - some of the registries were interested. And registrars were interested participating to really deal - to kind of bring to the table the implementation experience that they'd had.

J. Scott Evans: Well I mean, unfortunately...

Kristina Rosette But I know that...

J. Scott Evans: ...they're not showing up to the call...

Kristina Rosette No, no, no, no, no I know, I don't disagree with you; I'm just saying that having been on these groups before you'd be surprised who's going to pop out of the woodwork on the last, you know, when they think...

J. Scott Evans: Right.

Kristina Rosette ...it's coming down to the wire, put it that way. (Unintelligible), or you won't be surprised, (Kelly) won't be surprised. I won't, you might be.

But no, I completely agree and in fact, you know, maybe one of the things that we want to think about doing is that to the extent that we want to have a session that talks about quote unquote constructive, you know, criticisms or suggestions or something like that, is to go back to the proof-of-concept reports or actually in more in particular I guess, what would probably be most helpful is the Summit Strategies report that went over all of the TLDs.

J. Scott Evans: Mm-hm. Well I think these are issues that need to be discussed. But with three IT people here any decisions we would come to is going to be subject to, you know, some sort of criticism for being front loaded. So, I mean I think it's an issue that needs to be discussed; we just need to get people to come to the call so we can discuss it.

Kristina Rosette Right.

J. Scott Evans: So I mean at this point I think what we should do is once - I mean, maybe I should just aim for bringing to, you know, sending out something in a week or so that continues along the line that I've been going with the text. And then we could raise those issues in an email, if I can ever get the text actually delivered to the people it's supposed to go to. Because it still hasn't hit my inbox either and I think I should have gotten one.

So if worse comes to worse Glen, I'm just going to send it to you.

Glen Desaintgery: Okay and I'll distribute it.

J. Scott Evans: Yes.

Glen Desaintgery: Because I haven't seen anything else, but my email is bit sluggish too.

Kristina Rosette I haven't, but you know, I had a similar problem with the Devane Tasting list last week where for whatever reason things didn't get on...

J. Scott Evans: I don't know.

Kristina Rosette ...the first time. But anyway Glen, you know, I'm happy to...

J. Scott Evans: I can send you just a copy...

Kristina Rosette Sure.

J. Scott Evans: ...straight to you.

Kristina Rosette Okay. And what would be most helpful from me in terms of just kind of - this is what I think we need to do, kind of...

J. Scott Evans: Yes, I mean...

Kristina Rosette Okay.

J. Scott Evans: ...if you want to give, you know, yes this is okay, but here's some other things and considerations we need to put in.

Kristina Rosette Okay.

J. Scott Evans: I mean it's very rough right now, so.

Kristina Rosette Yes. Well and I've also got a (unintelligible), I've also got a ton of stuff that I wrote up and never bothered to send to that to the pro-working group, because I just...

J. Scott Evans: We can certainly, you know, look at, you know...

Kristina Rosette Yes.

J. Scott Evans: But I'm trying to do as much as can, but I'm also trying to relocate my family half way - well half way hell, completely across the United States, so...

Kristina Rosette Understood. All right.

J. Scott Evans: I mean my goal would be to have a - at least the sections divided in a first draft of the sections we're going to include by the meeting in LA. So that right, you know, before that meeting it should be given (electronically) to the list and people could show up with that in hand to their comments.

Kristina Rosette Right. That works for me.

J. Scott Evans: (Kelly)?

(Kelly Smith): Yes I'm not going there later, I can submit through comments (unintelligible)...

J. Scott Evans: Yes, you can, I mean cool, I mean, but...

Kristina Rosette All right.

J. Scott Evans: I mean there's nothing more we can do right now. We can just sort of put it into the shape we think it needs to be in and till, you know, and one of the reasons we may not be getting any comments is because I've been in ineptly put it to the list, so that is part of the problem, so...

Kristina Rosette Well and I think frankly, you know, I know (Jeff Newman) had been interested in participating in the (dot UF rebid), I think took up.

J. Scott Evans: (Unintelligible).

Kristina Rosette But that's been over for several weeks, but I think that kind of took up a good chunk of his summer when, you know, we all had momentum coming out of...

J. Scott Evans: Right.

Kristina Rosette ...(unintelligible), so I think that's...

Woman: We need a reminder to the list that suggests that, "Hey we got this, it needs input and especially needs input about the supplement for implementation of these different mechanisms.

J. Scott Evans: Okay, we'll nudge.

Woman: Oh I got your message. But you got the one I sent you directly from (JSC) and adamscott.com now.

Kristina Rosette Oh you're right, you're right. So all right.

J. Scott Evans: I'm sending it to Glen now. Okay. All right, well I don't think there's any need to have a call next week. Does anyone else?

Woman: No, uh-huh.

J. Scott Evans: So do we want to say - what's next week the 16th? So do we want to have a call on the 21st?

Kristina Rosette That's a Sunday. You mean the 23rd?

J. Scott Evans: Yes the 23rd, I'm sorry. (Unintelligible).

Kristina Rosette We could, it's right before LA, that - I mean that would be fine with me. That might kind of - I mean, my guess will be that...

J. Scott Evans: Well I'll make it my goal to have something circulated the Monday before, that the 22nd. All right?

Kristina Rosette Sure.

J. Scott Evans: Olofdid you? Is that okay?

(Olaff): Is this the 22nd?

J. Scott Evans: Yes. That way if we have a call on the 23rd which I - we'll have something - or we can just confirm who's going to be in our meeting, if nothing else.

Kristina Rosette Right.

J. Scott Evans: And they'll all have the document on the 22nd; that gives them five days before the 27th, that's when really want their comments.

(Olaff): And the 22nd would work for me, yes.

J. Scott Evans: Okay.

Kristina Rosette Yes that would be fine with me. Just got this - just skimming it right away it looks really good, the one thing that I - and I'm happy to, you know, email you directly, but one thing that kind of came out of the working session in San Juan, on the pro-working group report...

J. Scott Evans: Mm-hm.

Kristina Rosette Was that the folk who are basically, you know, the registry representatives from the, you know, the sponsored TLDs...

J. Scott Evans: Mm-hm.

(Christina Issac): ...feel pretty strongly that their eligibility and name selection (processes) are - has nothing to do with rights protection. So, but, you know, as a practical matter, that's one of the side effects of those.

J. Scott Evans: Well, you know, I no problem...

(Kelly Smith): And (unintelligible), I need to drop off...

J. Scott Evans: ...with acknowledging that.

Kristina Rosette Okay.

J. Scott Evans: That while it's seen by some (specters) in the community that this isn't a rights protection mechanism, those picking to protect their rights certainly has felt that it has...

Kristina Rosette Right.

J. Scott Evans: ...served as such, because there had been little or no...

Kristina Rosette Right.

J. Scott Evans: ...documented problem.

Kristina Rosette Right, right, right. And I absolutely think that, you know, that discussion needs to be in here, but I think it's just given the intensity of the reaction and that I got in San Juan, you know...

J. Scott Evans: I'd be glad to...

Kristina Rosette ...(unintelligible) with that.

(Jackard Evans): ...I'd be glad to bullsh their concerns and along with the (reality).

Kristina Rosette Right, exactly, exactly. All right well I will - do you want me to - would it be helpful to you to kind of get the ball rolling to post comments to the list?

J. Scott Evans: Whatever you want to do.

Kristina Rosette All right.

J. Scott Evans: Instead of directly to me since no one on the list has seen it yet.

Kristina Rosette Okay.

J. Scott Evans: And then I'll incorporate them and they can see them on the 22nd.

Kristina Rosette Okay.

J. Scott Evans: When I send around that draft.

Kristina Rosette Okay, I'll do that. So do you need...

J. Scott Evans: And (Kelly), same for you, if you've got anything you want to say to me, you can send it to me.

Kristina Rosette I think she had a drop off.

J. Scott Evans: Okay.

Kristina Rosette All right. Okie dokie.

J. Scott Evans: All right.

Kristina Rosette Yes.

J. Scott Evans: And Glen if you don't get that message by, you know, or later on today or first thing tomorrow, let me know.

Glen Desaintgery: Just give me your telephone number again, please (Jeff)  
(unintelligible).

J. Scott Evans: Yes 704...

Glen Desaintgery: Yes.

J. Scott Evans: Three, seven, five...

Glen Desaintgery: Seven, five.

J. Scott Evans: Nine, two...

Glen Desaintgery: Nine, two.

J. Scott Evans: Four, nine.

Glen Desaintgery: Four, nine. Thanks ever so much.

J. Scott Evans: All right.

Glen Desaintgery: All right.

J. Scott Evans: All right, we'll continue on, step back and - ready.

Kristina Rosette Excellent.

J. Scott Evans: All right.

Kristina Rosette Talk to everyone later.

Man: Bye.

Woman: Bye, thanks, bye.

Man: Bye-bye.

Woman: Hun?

Man: (Unintelligible).

END