

Minutes of the GNSO Council Meeting 18 January 2024

Agenda and Documents

GNSO Council meeting on Thursday, 18 January 2024 at 05:00 UTC: <http://tinyurl.com/y3a7xhu3>

21:00 Los Angeles (Wednesday); 00:00 Washington DC; 05:00 London; 06:00 Paris; 08:00 Moscow;
16:00 Melbourne

List of attendees:

Nominating Committee Appointee (NCA): – **Non-Voting** – Anne Aikman Scalese

Contracted Parties House

Registrar Stakeholder Group: Antonia Chu, Greg DiBiase, Prudence Malinki

gTLD Registries Stakeholder Group: Nacho Amadoz, Kurt Pritz, Jennifer Chung

Nominating Committee Appointee (NCA): Desiree Zeljka Miloshevic Evans

Non-Contracted Parties House

Commercial Stakeholder Group (CSG): Lawrence Olawale-Roberts, Mark Datysgeld, Osvaldo Novoa (absent), Thomas Rickert, Damon Ashcraft, Susan Payne

Non-Commercial Stakeholder Group (NCSG): Stephanie Perrin, Bruna Martins dos Santos (joined late, after vote), Wisdom Donkor, Tomslin Samme-Nlar, Peter Akinremi, Manju Chen

Nominating Committee Appointee (NCA): Paul McGrady

GNSO Council Liaisons/Observers :

Justine Chew : ALAC Liaison

Jeff Neuman: GNSO liaison to the GAC

Everton Rodrigues: ccNSO observer (apology sent)

Guests:

Carlos Reyes, Odeline MacDonald, Eleeza Agopian, Karen Lentz, and Dennis Chang - all from ICANN Org

ICANN Staff:

David Olive - Senior Vice President, Policy Development Support and Managing Manager, ICANN Regional (apology sent)

Mary Wong - Vice President, Strategic Policy Management

Steve Chan – Vice President, Policy Development Support & GNSO Relations

Julie Hedlund - Policy Development Support Director (GNSO)

Berry Cobb - Senior Program Manager, Policy Development Support (apology sent)

Caitlin Tubergen - Policy Development Support Director (GNSO)

Saewon Lee - Policy Development Support Manager (GNSO)

Terri Agnew - Policy Operations Specialist (GNSO)

Devan Reed - Secretariat Operations Coordinator

[Zoom recording](#)

[Transcript](#)

Item 1: Administrative Matters (5 minutes) | Item start time 05:00 UTC

1.1 - Roll Call

1.2 - Updates to Statements of Interest

1.3 - Review / Amend Agenda

1.4 - Note the status of minutes for the previous Council meetings per the GNSO Operating Procedures: [Minutes](#) of the GNSO Council Meeting on 16 November 2023 were posted on 01 December 2023.

[Minutes](#) of the GNSO Council Meeting on 21 December 2023 were posted on 02 January 2024

Item 2: Opening Remarks / Review of Projects & Action List (0 minutes) | Item start time: 05:05 UTC

2.1 - Review focus areas and provide updates on specific key themes / topics, to include review of [Projects List](#) and [Action Item List](#).

Item 3: Consent Agenda (5 minutes) | Item start time 05:05 UTC

- [Recommendations Report](#) for GNSO Guidance Process (“GGP”) for Applicant Support
- [Recommendations Report](#) for EPDP on Internationalized Domain Names Phase 1 Final Report

Manju Chen, GNSO Council Liaison to IDNs EPDP, noticed that the EPDP on Internationalized Domain Names Phase 1 Final Report in the consent agenda was a redline version and asked that it be updated for the Consent Agenda vote.

Steve Chan, ICANN org, confirmed that the Final Report document would be updated.

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, reminded Council there were discussions about improving recommendations reports during the December 2023 GNSO Council Strategic Planning Session. Leadership and staff determined that it was prudent to send these Recommendations Reports to the Board as soon as possible, but staff has incorporated some of that feedback into these reports.

All councilors present voted in favor of the motion.

[Vote results](#)

Recommendations Report for GNSO Guidance Process (“GGP”) for Applicant Support

Action Items: The GNSO Secretariat will transmit the Recommendations Report for GNSO Guidance Process (“GGP”) for Applicant Support to the ICANN Board and communicate the GNSO Council’s approval of the report.

Recommendations Report for EPDP on Internationalized Domain Names Phase 1 Final Report

Action Items: The GNSO Secretariat will transmit the Recommendations Report for EPDP on Internationalized Domain Names Phase 1 Final Report to the ICANN Board and communicate the GNSO Council’s approval of the report.

Item 4: COUNCIL DISCUSSION - SubPro Small Team Update on Non-Adopted Recommendations (20 minutes) | Item start time: 05:10 UTC

4.1 - Introduction of Topic (Paul McGrady, Small Team Plus Lead)

4.2 - Council Discussion

4.3 - Next Steps

Paul McGrady, Small Team Plus Lead, shared that the small team is running on time. Currently they are working on Recommendations 24.3 and 24.5, related to the singular and plural issue. A smaller team is currently wrapping up that work. This week, the Small Team Plus dealt with Recommendation 9.2, regarding the single registrant exemption to certain parts of Specification 11 of the Base Registry Agreement. There is a stable supplemental recommendation as a result of that discussion.. He recommended listening to call recordings and reaching out to himself or other small team members with questions.

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, clarified that councilors will be voting on these recommendations all at the same time, as opposed to individually, and asked when the recommendations will come back to Council for a vote.

Paul McGrady, Small Team Plus Lead, shared that while voting on the supplemental recommendations independently would be efficient, the community consultation process occurring at ICANN79 in Puerto Rico determined this timeline.

Steve Chan, ICANN org, explained that the goal for the Small Team Plus is to wrap up its proposed supplemental recommendation language at ICANN79. If there is feedback that requires changes to the supplemental recommendations, there is time for that to happen. The Council would vote on the package of supplemental recommendations at the 18 April 2024 GNSO Council meeting.

Kurt Pritz, RySG, asked if it is recommended to take the public briefing in Puerto Rico or if there will be a separate briefing for councilors on the substance of the recommendations.

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, advised all councilors to read the output and also attend the presentation at ICANN79.

Paul McGrady, Small Team Plus Lead, confirmed that the supplemental recommendations should be stable enough to review in Puerto Rico and recommended reviewing this topic during the informal session.

Peter Taiwo Akinremi, NCSG, asked how the small team wants to get community feedback at ICANN79.

Steve Chan, ICANN org, clarified that there will be a Prep Week webinar to brief the community as a whole as well as a separate session during ICANN79 proper to allow the community to provide feedback on the supplemental recommendations. There is also a session for the Small Team Plus on Thursday to take feedback from the community session and amend recommendations as needed. If needed, dedicated Council time can also be added to the ICANN79 meeting.

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, shared that the small team is a Small Team Plus with other members of the community providing ongoing feedback.

Item 5: COUNCIL DISCUSSION - Communications Small Team Follow-up Conversation (20 minutes) | Item start time: 05:30 UTC

5.1 - Introduction of Topic (Tomslin Samme-Nlar, Council Vice-Chair) Mary Wong & Carlos Reyes (icann org)

5.2 - Council Discussion

5.3 - Next Steps

Tomslin Samme-Nlar, Council Vice-Chair, shared that this is a continuation of the discussion councilors were having at the SPS. Some questions were raised regarding communicating with outsiders and making information more understandable or readable, and reaching the people that care about ICANN but do not have time to participate, and if Council should consider having a liaison to the broader community, and how the Council can target fellows. He remembered a comment about the small team assignment about the overall objective of the Council communications effort.

Kurt Pritz, RySG, shared that there was a great discussion about this during the SPS and asked about using some of the tools in the study to communicate what Council is doing as alternative channels of communication while thinking about these high level questions.

Tomslin Samme-Nlar, Council Vice-Chair, shared the hope that at the end of this discussion Council agrees to start using some aspects of the report.

Peter Taiwo Akenremi, NCSG, agreed that Council should start using the report and shared that it would be helpful to review on-site communication at ICANN79.

Tomslin Samme-Nlar, Council Vice-Chair, noted the idea to use a survey and noted Jeff Neuman, GNSO Liaison to the GAC's chat regarding making ICANN information user-friendly.

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, shared that concepts at ICANN are not normally shared at a high-level, and the community dives in using acronyms and discussing policy. He noted that writing exercises using big picture language and analogies would be useful. He shared that there were other mechanisms to disseminate this information such as twitter.

Tomslin Samme-Nlar, Council Vice-Chair, shared that there was a suggestion to primarily use LinkedIn and to also send that information to Twitter using existing programs. There was also an ability to optimize to leverage existing reports for distributing the content.

Noted in Zoom Chat: Justine Chew (ALAC/GNSO Liaison) 01:05:03

@Jeff to your point, ALAC's plea on communications was directly to ICANN org mostly, but it also applies across the board.

We need to shorten reports etc and have like a really good executive summary which explains impact/result of what's being reported.

Mary Wong, ICANN org, thanked Tomslin Samme Nlar, and noted that ICANN org will gladly help refine messaging and leverage communications channels to get messaging across to an identified audience.

Tomslin Samme-Nlar, Council Vice-Chair, confirmed that the small team recommended using existing communications practices but improving them to target an additional audience. He asked if the intention is for the small team or new volunteers to improve the report and share again with the council while in parallel starting to utilize the tools outlined in the report.

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, confirmed that the small team will make a final update if needed and send the report to Council to review. He hopes the small team will continue to spearhead implementing the ideas in the report.

Action Items: Communications Small Team to update its report based on feedback received and distribute to the GNSO Council for review.

Item 6: COUNCIL DISCUSSION - Council Engagement with PDP Working Group Chairs (20 minutes) | item start time: 05:50 UTC

6.1 - Introduction of Topic (Nacho Amadoz, Council Vice-Chair)

6.2 - Council Discussion

6.3 - Next Steps

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, shared that this conversation was started at the SPS and introduced Nacho Amadoz, Council Vice-Chair.

Nacho Amadoz, Council Vice-Chair, explained that this was discussed on day two of the SPS while discussing if Council has the tools to be an effective manager of the Policy Development Process. It was discussed to move the Prep Week briefings. The outcome of the discussion was to make them more

effective and purpose-driven. There is a list of four questions on the [agenda](#) to ask the chairs before the webinars. One of the action items from the SPS was to leverage the existing format and propose technical elements. Ideally a group of volunteers from Council would work with staff and make suggestions to review the list of questions to make the discussion more purpose-driven and discuss when to schedule the briefing webinar outside of Prep Week.

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, feels that there should be a question about explaining a topic simply, as if the chair was explaining it to a child to provide a more basic summary of what is happening.

Nacho Amadoz, Council Vice-Chair, confirmed that question would be helpful and reflected back to the discussion on communication efforts. It is easy even for knowledgeable councilors to get lost in a topic that they are not specifically following.

Susan Payne, IPC, noted that if the principle is about if this is a session intended for councilors and all should attend as a compulsory session, then it would be helpful to not wait until the prep week schedule comes out. It is helpful to get this on the calendar in advance. She also recommended that this session coordinate with the Policy Update and the councilors read the update and come back together with the working group chairs for a deeper dive.

Nacho Amadoz, Council Vice-Chair, thanked Susan and affirmed that Prep Week is last minute and that this briefing has to be associated with ICANN meetings, as it is in preparation for the meeting. However it does not need to be in the joint effort of prep week. He noted that if councilors can prepare on their own using the policy report, it would be helpful, but if this is going to be about how the working group is going and they are providing Council feedback about this, a written report will not be useful.

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, confirmed that there are volunteers to think about the questions and how this is presented, and to make sure that this is not scheduled last minute. He checked in to see if Council was aligned in that this can be improved and is worthwhile to continue and received general agreement.

Manju Chen, NCSG, confirmed that she agrees that Council should have this session. During ICANN meetings the Council reviews the project management list and that this is an essential part of project management and those efforts can be combined into one session.

Action Items: Staff to call for volunteers to form a Small Team to draft a list of questions to pose to PDP Working Group chairs during the next webinar; volunteers during the meeting: Nacho Amadoz and Jeff Neuman.

Item 7: COUNCIL DISCUSSION - Registration Data Accuracy (20 minutes) | item start time: 06:10 UTC

7.1 - Introduction of Topic (Greg DiBiase, Council Chair) Odeline MacDonald, Eleeza Agopian

7.2 - Council Discussion

7.3 - Next Steps

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, reviewed the status of the scoping team, which had preliminary recommendations for a registrar survey and audit. That work was put on hold pending the execution of a Data Processing Agreement (DPA) between the contracted parties and ICANN, which is still not completed. The scoping team had also noted that there was not a lot of data regarding the effectiveness of mechanisms to enforce accuracy. ICANN identified ways that more data could be obtained and sent a [report](#) to the Council that identified potential problems with methods to request data to access accuracy. They noted two alternatives, a Contractual Compliance RAA Audit Program and engaging ICANN contracted parties on current developments regarding European policymaking. Additionally there is a study called the Inferential Analysis of Maliciously Registered Domains (INFERMAL) that could potentially inform this work. Council voted on an extension five months ago, and given that the DPA is not executed and the INFERMAL Study is not executed, and neither is NIS2. He highlighted that there will be a vote on this next Council meeting and opened the floor for discussion.

Stephanie Perrin, NCSG, noted that until Council sees the DPA between ICANN and the Contracted Parties, the problems are stemming from ICANN's lack of taking up the role of being the data controller. There is not much point in starting up in February if there has been no progress.

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, confirmed that it is six months or until there has been progress made to make this work more feasible. He noted several councilors providing support in the chat and asked if staff has an update on the DPA.

Damon Ashcraft, IPC, shared that he agrees with continuing to check in but not waiting for the DPA to start this work again.

Odeline MacDonald, ICANN org, shared that ICANN is in ongoing discussions with Contracted Parties but there is nothing significant to communicate to the group yet.

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, thanked Odeline and shared that if there is no update by next time it may be worth a letter or assigning a small team to document the GNSO Council's requests for progress.

Item 8: ANY OTHER BUSINESS (30 minutes) | item start time: 06:30 UTC

8.1 Update on ICANN79 planning and GNSO Draft schedule

Terri Agnew, ICANN org, shared the relevant meetings for GNSO councilors at ICANN79, on the [GNSO Draft Schedule](#), including GNSO Council Working Sessions and the Bilateral session with ICANN Board.

Action Items: Staff to publish a revised GNSO Draft schedule for ICANN79.

8.2 Update from SO/AC Roundtable

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, shared that there was an SO/AC Roundtable, where SO/AC Chairs and Vice-Chairs met with ICANN staff and Chair of the ICANN Board, Tripti Sinha, and some members of the Board. They discussed high level concerns of the community and there will be a report sent to council He highlighted two themes for council to discuss: discussion of ICANN's risk tolerance or risk calculus, and the Holistic Review and Continuous Improvement efforts in the community.

8.3 Update on Diacritic Study Request

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, shared that Mark Datysgeld sent details to leadership and staff. They are working to frame it as a study, rather than as Policy making. He confirmed that leadership and staff are working on what Mark Datysgeld provided and will send that out to Council in the next couple of weeks.

Action Items: Leadership and staff to develop a draft request for Council to review.

8.4 Update on PPSAI Implementation (Karen Lentz and Dennis Chang)

Karen Lentz, ICANN org, explained that Privacy and Proxy Service Accreditation Issues has been focusing on wrapping up EPDP Phase 1 implementation, and they are anticipating actively working on the Privacy/Proxy set of Policy recommendations in 2024. The PPSAI team is working on identifying if any implementation changes need to be made since the previous work on Privacy/Proxy recommendations was paused. There was an informal meeting of the previous IRT at ICANN78 in Hamburg.

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, clarified that the path forward is for the IRT to form and to define how the IRT would proceed.

Karen Lentz, ICANN org, confirmed and further explained that the IRT work plan lays out the intended approach and explains any changes from previous implementation.

Susan Payne, IPC, asked if Karen Lentz could share the recording or notes from the informal IRT meeting at ICANN78.

Karen Lentz, ICANN org, offered to circulate notes from the meeting, and clarified that the meeting was not recorded. She further shared that she would not compare this to an Operational Design Phase, which was created to help the Board make a decision about proceeding with Policy recommendations.

Action Items: Staff to circulate the notes from the informal PPSAI IRT meeting from ICANN78.

8.5 Expected Standards of Behavior

Jeffrey Neuman, GNSO Liaison to the GAC, made a [statement](#) regarding ongoing concerns regarding the Expected Standards of Behavior and a vendor for ICANN.

Ad hoc Item 8.6

Steve Chan, ICANN org, introduced a new member of the GNSO Support team, Saewon Lee.

Greg DiBiase, GNSO Chair, adjourned the meeting at 06:22 UTC

The next GNSO Council meeting will take place on Thursday, 15 February 2024 at 21:00 UTC.