ICANN
Transcription ICANN64 Kobe
GNSO – RySG GeoTLD Group .city TLD Conference Part 2
Wednesday, 13 March 2019 at 10:30 JST
Note: Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases it is incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages or transcription errors. It is posted as an aid to understanding the proceedings at the meeting, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.
The recordings and transcriptions of the calls are posted on the GNSO Master Calendar page
http://gnso.icann.org/en/group-activities/calendar

Sebastien Ducos: Welcome back to this second half of the session. We've lost the whole side of the table here. They're all having a meeting together actually down the hall but they'll come later.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:00:12)).

Sebastien Ducos: So Sue, can I have the next slide?

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:00:31)).

Sebastien Ducos: So we're going to have a presentation now from the City of Kyoto by Professor Kenji Imai. Please.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:00:44)).

Kenji Imai: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:00:50-0:11:59)).

Sebastien Ducos: Thank you, Professor, for your presentation.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:12:07)).

Sebastien Ducos: This goes right to one of my own personal targets here for today and is to talk about the relationship between cities and TLDs.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:12:22)).

Sebastien Ducos: We saw in the previous presentation that the City of Tokyo is finding difficulties in getting involved, but obviously it's not the case in Kyoto.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:12:46)).

Sebastien Ducos: As far as I'm concerned, a new GeoTLD is like a new bridge or a new electricity provider or a new - it's something for the people. The city needs to be involved and own it too for it to stay and last.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:13:16)).

Sebastien Ducos: And we see in our members the two models; the more Tokyo model, the very private owned and the city in the back, and your model too. It seems to work too and it's interesting in the presentation here the two complete different angels.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:14:00)).

Sebastien Ducos: Thank you.

Kenji Imai: Thank you.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:14:21)).

Kenji Imai: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:14:20-0:18:14)). Thank you.

Sebastien Ducos: Any more questions for (Professor Mi)?

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:18:27)).

Sebastien Ducos: Thank you very much. (Unintelligible).

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:18:36)).

Sebastien Ducos: And so we'll go directly onto the presentation with (Unintelligible).

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:18:53)).

Man 2:   ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:19:00-0:34:54)).

                    (Unintelligible) have not (unintelligible) much yet, but I hope you understand what we are trying to accomplish. Thank you.

Sebastien Ducos: I thank you very much for this. I'm originally from Paris and I understand that in Paris policy is also there is wording like Osaka about the fact that the TLD is for the people that love the City of Paris, so maybe a friendship to discover there between your two interests.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:35:42)).

Man 2:   ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:36:00)).

Sebastien Ducos: The question of slow-growth or slower than anticipated growth of a TLD is something that we all feel inside GeoTLDs or outside of GeoTLDs. This is not a Geo specific.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:36:29)).

Sebastien Ducos: And if it's one thing that we've seen in the last six years of operations of those new gTLDs is a world where the TLDs where the high demand and where controlling the market has shifted now in favor of registrars and the sales channel that we've all seen.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:37:07)).

Sebastien Ducos: And this is what the difficulty is and, I mean, don't worry about the fact that it's taking time; don't worry about the fact that it's slow. We've all seen this and we all understand it.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:37:41)).

Sebastien Ducos: In my earlier analogy in offering a bridge to the city, not everybody is going to use that bridge on Day 1, but in the end it will become part of the fiber of the city.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:38:05)).

Sebastien Ducos: Does anybody have any questions about this last presentation?

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:38:37)).

Dirk Krischenowski: Dirk Krischenowski from dotBerlin. In the last dotCities Conference in Barcelona, the Cities said -- or the city representatives said -- that the city top level domain name is for them a great tool for city marketing and for spreading out the name to world. So it's used in domain names and in email addresses. And it would be interesting to hear from the participants what they see how city marketing could use it - dotTokyo, dotOsaka, dotKyoto.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:39:40)).

Jacob Williams: Hi, I'm Jacob Williams from Osaka Registry. I don't talk much at ICANN meetings but this business is kind of an important thing to mention.

                  Professor Imai also mentioned in his presentation that the government -- the local government -- does have difficulty adapting to a new domain. And dotOsaka we have the exact same situation.

So as far as getting the marketing for the city going, we first need the government to stand up and make use of the domain names to show that there is trust in it because I think we're for the most part lacking that first step of showing trust to the end users that the domain is there to stay.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:41:43)).

Kenji Imai: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:42:42-0:50:54)).

Sebastien Ducos: So you mean in New York City for example?

Kenji Imai: (Unintelligible) New York.

Sebastien Ducos: Yes. So I represent New York City. I don't live there but it's one of our TLDs.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:51:14)).

Sebastien Ducos: So the first and obvious thing about New York City is it's an enormous city; it's a small country of its own. So it has a very large population and we often talk in this business about critical mass; it has that mass to start with.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:51:42)).

Sebastien Ducos: The second is that New York itself has for years a very, very, very strong friend starting from the 70's with everybody knows the I Love New York t-shirt and NYC -- the brand of NYC is very, very strong.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:52:11)).

Sebastien Ducos: And the third one is a bit of a thing of circumstance. In New York, a lot of the advertising that you see -- the street advertising on bus shelters, on walls -- belongs to the city. The real estate for the advertising belongs to the city.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:52:49)).

Sebastien Ducos: And they didn't contribute any money, they didn't buy almost any domains. But we did have an agreement with them that lasted for the first two or three years where whenever there wasn't any sold space, and they would know two or three days before, they would give it to us.

Woman 2:   (Unintelligible).

Sebastien Ducos: Yes, yes.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:53:36)).

Sebastien Ducos: So we knew, for example, from one day that seven days later we would have that space for the next seven days.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:54:08)).

Sebastien Ducos: And which allowed us to have micro marketing campaign super targeted - a bus stop and the three shops around it or something like that. And immediately target a neighborhood or target something, promote a shop that had just bought a dotNYC or do things like that with gorilla marketing that was very efficient.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:54:44)).

Sebastien Ducos: Now there's no secret and we've been quite vocal about it too, this sort of exercise cost a lot. What GMOs are doing in Tokyo costs a lot. You invest a lot; you don't make your money back or you barely break even. So there's no secret. To have a lot of sales you need to invest a lot of marketing in effort. And we had a team that was doing this 24/7 that was racing after this in order to get those numbers. They don't come through the door by themselves.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:55:49)).

Man: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:56:26)).

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:56:29)).

Kenji Imai: Oh. ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:56:45)).

Sebastien Ducos: Come on. Say something; don't make me sing and dance.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:57:08)).

Gavin McCutcheon: Just following on - sorry; Gavin McCutcheon from Dot Scott Registry.
                 Following on from what the chap from Osaka was saying. My background
                 was always in developing intangible assets what ICANN loosely terms IP
                 lobby. But contradictory to what the ICANN IP lobby think, there's more to it
                 than just trademarks.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:57:46)). I'm sorry. What did you say about
                 (unintelligible)?

Gavin McCutcheon: There's more to IP than just trademarks.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:58:08)).

Gavin McCutcheon: And to manage, to acquire, manage and exploit IP properly, you have to
                 understand what the nature of those intangible assets are. Now it could be as
                 in one case, the aim is to acquire as many as possible. As (Khrushchev) once
                 said, a quantity is a quality all of its own.

Translator: I'm sorry, you have been developing intangible assets.

Gavin McCutcheon: Intangible assets.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:58:47)).

Gavin McCutcheon: But at Dot Scot, what we wanted to build was the same as yourself; it was a reputation - a quality. And that is irrespective of quantity. Yes, we would like to have more domains, but for us it's more important to have high-quality domains; domains people use, domains people will go too.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 0:59:49)).

Gavin McCutcheon: So while we only have 11,000 and a bit domains, we are happy that over 90% are renewed every year and a high percentage are actually used in reality. And that keeps us happy. I am deeply jealous of yourself with 130,000 domains, but we will never get there. That's not what we are trying to achieve.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:00:45)).

Tadashi Yokoyama: Cities - my name is Tadashi Yokoyama and I should say we support a number of city TLDs and (unintelligible) TLDs. Cities are peculiar because they are concentrated and have lots of culture in them.

Translator: Your name is?

Tadashi Yokoyama: Tadashi.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:01:58)).

Tadashi Yokoyama: And this shows in many cases in the way that the city has more than one name.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:02:27)).

Tadashi Yokoyama: In countries where we have a different alphabet and a Latin alphabet, this of course is very important.

Translator: Latin alphabet and European alphabet.

Tadashi Yokoyama: Latin script and Japanese script.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:02:47)).

Tadashi Yokoyama: In this context, there has been historic accident in that ICANN has treated each word as a separate concept and did not allow a combined operation of multiple names for a single registry.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:03:17)).

Tadashi Yokoyama: I believe this has done a lot of damage to the potential of city TLDs by more than one name is in question.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:03:46)).

Tadashi Yokoyama: But we should not give up. Actually ICANN is now preparing for the next round. We see that the same mistakes of the past are being preprogrammed again. But it is the right time to stand up and say something about it and say that concepts such as a city should be integrated as one concept; not as many as there are names of that city.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:04:28)).

Tadashi Yokoyama: In this context, ICANN has recently written a paper about IDN variance.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:05:07)).

Tadashi Yokoyama: And we can see there that there is the same misconception thinking that there can be more than one IDN for a given domain such as (unintelligible) and like a (unintelligible) in Japanese in two versions -- which actually exists as an exception. But this was possible because it was ccTLD.

But for the equivalent of ASCII and idea graft, ICANN has not been ready to listen. And we have the same problem for Quebec which is (unintelligible) as a city and a province. But Quebec, there is an ASCII and an IDN, and ICANN would not listen that these are actually equivalent. It's not a variant because they're both of the (unintelligible).

Do you think we should, you know, communicate with ICANN and, you know, help prepare for the next round?

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:06:15)).

Sebastien Ducos: I don't know if you were there already earlier in the first part, I believe, it was in your presentation (unintelligible), there was a study of pairs of TLDs like (Cumator) and (Wells) and WW and W in Arabic. And would you consider these the same issue?

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:07:28)).

Tadashi Yokoyama: Yes I do actually.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:07:59)).

Ronald Schwaerzler: Ronald Schwaerzler from Dot Wien which is Vienna. I'm super impressed about the variety of TLDs' presentations that we have heard today.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:08:19)).

Ronald Schwaerzler: We have the highly commercial Dot Tokyo who is relying on hundreds and thousands of sales to the end user to the registrant by registrant channels.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:08:43)).

Ronald Schwaerzler: We had Dot Osaka who is or which is also - if there were sales would be (unintelligible) to the community having a committee looking on how to spend some money, so giving something back to the community.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:09:17)).

Ronald Schwaerzler: And we have Dot Kyoto who would even reject the domain name application if it doesn't fit to the Dot Kyoto brand or who (unintelligible) personal attachment where the domain name fits or not. It is unbelievable variety really focusing on various business models. So thank you for presenting us this and getting us to learn all these various kinds of how you can run TLDs; very, very impressive. Thank you.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:10:09)).

Man 3:   ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:10:49)).

Sebastien Ducos: Anybody else?

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:13:04))?

Sebastien Ducos: Well I'd like to thank all the presenters also. This has been a great morning; very interesting, very instructive. I would like to also -- in the name of the GeoTLD group thank, very especially, into (Link) and (GMO) who have been absolutely key in organizing this. We don't have the contact; you have the contact. And I have been pushing Jacob and (Leann) in particular. It's very hard to try to organize this.

I wanted to thank also ICANN for helping us. And (Juring) is not there, but Mei, I hope you're able to pass this, in helping us organizing the interpretation.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:13:59)).

Sebastien Ducos: We will endeavor, as GeoTLD group, to organize these meetings in every city and in every country where it's relevant -- where there are GeoTLDs, where there is an interest -- to showcase what it's done locally.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:14:50)).

Sebastien Ducos: And I really appreciate the participation and the help you've given us in demonstrating that this is something that is useful.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:15:09)).

Sebastien Ducos: We'd like to take a picture with all the speakers and the presenters and whoever else wants to be in the picture to memorialize this. But already thank you very much.

We still have the room for a few minutes, but please also don't forget to exchange business cards and contact emails and let's keep this group discussion going.

Translator: ((Foreign Language Spoken 1:15:46)).

END